From: Ford, John

To: <u>Elizabeth Burks; Duke, Natalie; Lippre, Suzanne</u>

Subject: Fw: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 7:01:33 PM

**From:** Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Sent: Monday, December 9, 2019 6:12 PM

**To:** Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve <SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bass, Virginia <VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex <RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Fennell, Estelle <EFennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Wilson, Mike <Mike.Wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve <smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>

**Subject:** FW: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

FYI

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board County of Humboldt (707) 476-2396 khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us

From: Miguel Robles < Miguel. Robles. 260529862@p2a.co>

**Sent:** Monday, December 9, 2019 6:11 PM **To:** Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards,
Miguel Robles

 From:
 Lynne Abels

 To:
 PlanningBuilding

 Cc:
 Damico, Tracy

 Subject:
 Humboldt Wind

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 11:51:49 AM

#### Dear Supervisors;

I urge you to vote no on the proposed wind farm. I am one of many people who originally favored the project who have come to oppose it. My opposition is due to the fact that it is poorly sited earning the lowest possible rating from Fish and Game. The impacts to birds, bats, and native plants have been poorly mitigated leading to opposition from the American Bird Conservancy which advocates for bird safe wind development and the Audubon Society. The wind farm is sited on grassland which is a rare ecosystem in California and a valuable carbon sink. Construction of the towers will destroy a site sacred to the Wiyot tribe, and risk the condor introduction program led by the Yurok tribe. Both these tribe opposed the project.

Like many of us, I am afraid of the approaching effects of the climate emergency which become more evident every day. I feel the urgency of our need to respond. However, heedless response is how we got ourselves into this mess in the first place. Large corporations will use our urgency to distort reality and move us to act in ways that make lots of money for them but end up being against our interests. I believe this is what Terra-Gen is doing in its rush to push the project forward.

All energy development presents problems and costs. There is no path to move forward in any direction without making significant sacrifices.

However we must feel these sacrifices are shared or the ensuing conflicts will prevent any action at all. Asking native people to make the most sacrifice is a signal that the future will be a repeat of our bad actions in the past. When I think of this I just feel ashamed.

Please do not let fear and urgency bring us a legacy of shame and regret.

Lynne Abels Arcata resident

William R. Warf 2980 Mattole Road PO Box 161 Ferndale, CA 95536

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

December 8, 2019

Humboldt County Board of Supervisors Clerk of the Board 825 Fifth Street, Room 111 Eureka, CA

Subject: Approve Humboldt Wind Project

Dear Supervisors,

I am writing to ask that you approve the Humboldt Wind Project for Monument and Bear River Ridges. I am a retired mechanical engineer and a resident of that area, in fact, it is my "back yard".

Climate experts and participants at conference in Madrid right now are calling for Governments around the world to do more to address CO2 emissions, stating that actions to date are not enough to avoid irreversible climate change. But you have a chance to act. This project will reduce CO2 emissions from electricity consumed in Humboldt County by half or more within a couple years.

I think the project is well thought out, and I'm grateful for our CEQA process for allowing mitigations to be identified and refined. I think the arguments for the project outweigh the arguments against it.

Your approval of this project will be remembered by our grandchildren long after your term as supervisor has ended. You had the courage to do the right thing-keeping the lights on without contributing to the global emergency by failing to act.

I'll be attending your public meeting on December 16, and will request a time to publicly argue for the project.

Respectfully submitted,

William R. Warf, P.E.

### **Damico, Tracy**

From:

Lynne Abels <lynneabels@gmail.com>

Sent:

Sunday, December 8, 2019 8:47 PM

To:

PlanningBuilding

Cc: Subject: Damico, Tracy Humboldt Wind

#### Dear Supervisors;

I urge you to vote no on the proposed wind farm. I am one of many people who originally favored the project who have come to oppose it. My opposition is due to the fact that it is poorly sited earning the lowest possible rating from Fish and Game. The impacts to birds, bats, and native plants have been poorly mitigated leading to opposition from the American Bird Conservancy which advocates for bird safe wind development and the Audubon Society. The wind farm is sited on grassland which is a rare ecosystem in California and a valuable carbon sink. Construction of the towers will destroy a site sacred to the Wiyot tribe, and risk the condor introduction program led by the Yurok tribe. Both these tribe opposed the project.

Like many of us, I am afraid of the approaching effects of the climate emergency which become more evident every day. I feel the urgency of our need to respond. However, heedless response is how we got ourselves into this mess in the first place. Large corporations will use our urgency to distort reality and move us to act in ways that make lots of money for them but end up being against our interests. I believe this is what Terra-Gen is doing in its rush to push the project forward.

All energy development presents problems and costs. There is no path to move forward in any direction without making significant sacrifices.

However we must feel these sacrifices are shared or the ensuing conflicts will prevent any action at all. Asking native people to make the most sacrifice is a signal that the future will be a repeat of our bad actions in the past. When I think of this I just feel ashamed.

Please do not let fear and urgency bring us a legacy of shame and regret.

Lynne Abels
Arcata resident

From: <u>Terri</u>

To: Planning Clerk
Subject: Terra-Gen

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 9:57:43 AM

#### Dear Planning Commissioners and Staff,

I have been reading about the Terra-Gen proposed wind project and attended the November public hearings. May I offer a lay-person's suggestion about placement of windmills in our area?

When I heard that the Bear River Ridge location would require tree removals, road access construction and large concrete pads for each wind turbine, I wondered if anyone has considered locating a wind project along our north and south jetties? There are no trees or green belt to clear, the road is already in place and more, improved concrete pads would be welcome as repairs to the current state of things there. And there is a lot of wind! I realize the Coastal Commission might have to approve this location, but they may offer more leniency now since the climate crisis has been accelerating and we need solutions rapidly.

I hope we can find the political will and willingness to stretch our options for solutions to our immediate need for clean, renewable energy while we reduce our energy use and increase our care for the Earth.





From: Janice Olmo

To: Planning Clerk

Subject: Terra-Gen Wind Project

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 8:21:02 AM

Dear Mike Newman,

My name is Janice Olmo and I live at 1324 Bay St in Eureka. I am opposed to the the project for various reasons.

- 1. Wiyot Tribe spiritual grounds
- 2. Ecological Reasons

I am not Native American but I have family members that are and I understand their sensitivity to having their spiritual grounds desecrated.

I am not against clean energy. It just needs to be moved to another location.

And will it benefit Humboldt County?

I can't be at the meeting on December 16 at the Adorni Center so I am sending this e-mail to you in hopes you will veto this project.

Sincerely, Janice Olmo 1324 Bay St Eureka, CA 95501 Sent from my iPad From: <u>Xicotenga Tamayo</u>
To: <u>Hayes, Kathy</u>

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 12:17:35 PM

#### Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Xicotenga Tamayo From: Ronald Poff
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 12:14:17 PM

#### Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Ronald Poff From: <u>Dustin Howarth</u>
To: <u>Hayes, Kathy</u>

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 12:06:31 PM

#### Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Dustin Howarth From: Sean Oriarte
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 12:04:55 PM

#### Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Sean Oriarte From: <u>uncahowa@gmail.com</u>

To: <u>Hayes, Kathy</u>

Subject: Terra Genn industrial wind proposal

Date: Monday, December 9, 2019 10:57:16 AM

#### I reject the proposal for the following reasons:

- 1- the proposed project doesn't become carbon neutral until after offshore project can begin.
- 2- won't lower electrical costs or curtail Eureka's existing PG&E plant use.
- 3- adds high voltage wires in fire prone windy areas and won't help us when PG&E shuts down the grid.
- 4- creates a disruptive and deadly wall in a vital wildlife corridor.

These wild ridges with their abundant flora and fauna are our Noah's Ark in the face of the mass extinctions already underway. Before deciding on a project of this scale, you need to visit an industrial wind factory, then go to Monument Ridge and visualize the 600 ft. towers with their huge spinning blades and flashing red lights. This would be visible from all your districts and beyond.

Although I've lived and worked here for 30 years, I'm originally from Contra Costa County and am familiar with wind factories. Nothing else thrives within their shadow. Communities, ranches, farms, birds, bats and even pollinators cannot coexist with them. These are important reasons for maintaining our quality of life. If you really like wind generators, a more appropriate siting is offshore where their effects are less destructive. Better yet, tell Terra Gen to upgrade their existing factories.

Please deny this proposal and support efforts to establish more solar energy in Humboldt County. Thanks,

Howard Russell. Eureka.

From: Charles Costello
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 10:48:43 AM

#### Dear Member of the Board,

Please consider harnessing the wind to help make Humboldt County self sufficient.

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Charles Costello December 6, 2019

RE: On-shore Wind Project

To Board of Supervisors:

Some projects make sense. Some are misguided. My hope is that the intended role of government, to provide the most good for the most people, will rule the day.

The project in question is the industrial-scale wind farm for electricity production proposed for ridges overlooking Rio Dell and Ferndale. I fear that this fits into the category of "doesn't make sense."

Let's make the assumption that the 99% of the scientific community that understand climate science are correct in stating that the burning of carbon-based fuels is a major contributor to the climate change we've been experiencing and are expected to see accelerate. Accepting this as fact, we are now compelled to drastically alter the worldwide practice of using carbon for the majority of our fuels. Fortunately, without waiting for a major breakthrough, we have options that are ready for the here and now.

Seeing the needs, various projects, both large and small, have been proposed. Some make good sense.

Calculations and statistics are summoned to bolster a given viewpoint. The presentations range from truth to hyperbole to bizarre lies. Bringing this back to our question of what are the best ways to produce large volumes of renewable electricity and heat, let's consider the local options and include some of the less discussed consequences.

One of the many proposals is roof top solar. These systems can harvest heat for hot water and/or space heating (aka solar thermal). Or a roof top can produce electricity. Or both forms of energy can be produced on the houses associated with these productive roof areas. These systems displace the burning of carbon-based fuels and make sense both financially and for our collective energy use.

Moderate sized roof top systems also make sense such as can be installed on larger industrial buildings. A building with a photovoltaic (PV) system can produce more electricity than is needed and sell the excess back to the shared electric grid. Given that too few roofs currently have roof top solar, the surplus electricity would be used and purchased by a neighboring building/business. These, too, make sense.

The good sense for the projects described above could be greatly enhanced with changes to the pricing structures created and used by power companies that truly encourage roof top solar. This is the law of the land in many countries worldwide. Less true in the United States.

Looking at our local potentials for residential and business roof top solar, there are thousands of roofs available that could be producing useful heat and electricity.

One obvious place to begin is the rental market. Many houses are owned by a landlord and lived in by a renter. The renter, often those who are not in a financial position to own, has been entirely left out of any advantages that solar has to offer. Under current rules, the landlord could receive a 30% federal tax credit and an accelerated depreciation for the solar project(s). The monthly rent + utility bill would be lower with the solar production. This fact would yield lower vacancy rates on solarized houses. Landlords win. Renters win. Less carbon burned means we all win.

If we use the most narrow of calculations, the 150 megawatt, \$200 million dollar proposed cost for the wind farm could purchase roof top solar for 16,326 houses with a total rating of 57.1 megawatts. This calculation uses the most expensive current pricing for roof top projects. The reality is the economy of scale (installing an entire neighborhood vs. a single home) would lower the price per house. The new lower costs would mimic solarizing an industrial building or parking lot yielding even more electric generation per dollar.

It should escape no one's notice that the number of solar installation jobs would be welcomed. Also, no new roads or powerlines, with both construction and maintenance costs, would be needed. Money would stay local. And projects could begin within days.

As to additional options, I have supported and do support other wind projects. A proposal had been floated for a wind project near the FairhOSaven wood-fired plant. Given that the infrastructure is largely in place on utility scale, this makes sense.

An off-shore wind power plant has been recommended. This, too, I support.

There was a proposal for wave energy off of Humboldt Bay. Sadly, this project was scuttled and the benefits all moved to Oregon. I supported this effort also.

Some projects make sense. Roof top solar for both electricity and hot water make sense for household budgets, county economics, self-reliance, and environmental progress. Projects that benefit the most people for the most good make sense.

l ask that the proposed On-shore	Wind Project be denied.
----------------------------------	-------------------------

Respectfully,

Alan Cook

December 8, 2019

Dear Supervisors,

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the Humboldt Wind Project.

My reasons for opposing this project are as follows:

#### **SITING**

Many experts consider ridgetop siting of wind turbines to be problematic both for operation & maintenance reasons, and because of impacts to wildlife and natural carbon sequestration. Siting on already-developed and degraded land is routinely advocated.

file:///C:/Users/Licensed%20User/Desktop/Wind%20Farm/PC%20Staff%20Report%2011.07.19. pdf p 37

reference on siting

#### **Earthquakes and Soil Instability**

This is by far the largest project ever developed for this area of high to moderate instability riddled with historic landslides, historic quaternary faults, and dizzying array of soil types, many of which are highly expansive.

https://humboldtgov.org/DocumentCenter/View/1747/Bedrock-Geology---South-PD slides

https://humboldtgov.org/DocumentCenter/View/72198/37-Geology-and-Soils faults & soils 3.7-2,4

Are the Terra-Gen turbines and construction protocols specifically designed for these much more challenging conditions than the low elevation flatland conditions on which their other projects are sited?

Is Humboldt County building code staff up to the immense task of evaluating, monitoring and enforcement of seismic and geologic requirements for safe installation, operation, and maintenance of forty-seven 600 ft tall, 400 ft wide wind turbines in a manner which renders any potential hazards to be less than significant?

e.g. "The geotechnical engineering report is subject to review by and approval of the County's Planning & Building Department. The final geotechnical engineering report would address and make recommendations on:

- **>** site preparation;
- soil bearing capacity;
- appropriate sources and types of fill;
- potential need for soil amendments:
- road, pavement, and parking areas;

- structural foundations, including retaining-wall design;
- appropriate foundation designs that are consistent with grading practices in the current version of the CBC;
- soil corrosion of concrete and steel;
- erosion/winterization:
- seismic ground shaking;
- ▶ liquefaction;
- expansive soils; and
- unstable soils (including landslides).

FEIR 3.7 Geology & Soils, despite 36 pages of exhaustive descriptions of site conditions, contains no descriptions of possible earthquake or landslide impacts to the project, - no risk assessment, probable consequences to structures & operations even though "Geologists believe that the Cascadia subduction zone may be capable of producing a large-magnitude earthquake (i.e., maximum moment magnitude 8 or 9) every 300–400 years. Geologic evidence indicates that the last large-magnitude earthquake in the region (approximate moment magnitude 9) occurred in January 1700, along the entire length of the Cascadia subduction zone. Therefore, assuming a 300- to 400-year occurrence level, the region could be subject to a large and potentially destructive earthquake in this century (Mendocino Triple Junction PBO Working Group 2000)"

Or "Since the 1870s, more than 15 earthquakes with a magnitude of 6.0 or greater have occurred in the region, including a magnitude 7.2 earthquake in 1923. In 1992, a series of three earthquakes with magnitudes 7.2, 6.5, and 6.7 (USGS 2009) occurred offshore at the southern end of the Cascadia subduction zone. These earthquakes had Modified Mercalli Intensity Scale intensities of VIII and caused substantial damage to older buildings and structures in Ferndale, Petrolia, Fortuna, Rio Dell, and Scotia. In January and February 2010, earthquakes with respective magnitudes of 6.5 and 5.9 occurred approximately 20–40 miles west of the site of the proposed generation facilities (Berkeley Seismological Laboratory 2010; USGS 2011)."

Or "A number of the faults in the project vicinity are classified by the California Geological Survey as active (i.e., showing evidence of movement within the last 11,000 years). Table 3.7-2 shows active faults in the region that may pose a potential geologic hazard to project components. Figure 3.7-2 shows the locations of active faults in the project region, along with the Cascadia subduction zone and the Mendocino Triple Junction. "

Or "Areas of unstable slopes are located in the project vicinity, and are composed primarily of mélange materials of the Franciscan formation that break down into clay, which tends to slip when wet. The greatest risk from landslides is in areas where the slope would exceed 33 percent. A review of the study corridor indicates that the topography is rugged, with the majority of the land sloping at 30 percent or more (Figure 3.7-3). "

• Policy S-P11: Site Suitability. New development may be approved only if it can be demonstrated that the proposed development will neither create nor significantly contribute to, or be impacted by, geologic instability or geologic hazards.

The determinations of potential hazards being less than significant seem based on direct, immediate, on-site threats to humans, rather than the more likely off-site threats of fire, landslides, sediment inputs to waterways, massive power & infrastructure failures, etc,

from project-associated soil displacement and collapsing structures. Hazards due to the damaged project's effects on the environment post- geologic event seem to be overlooked.

The FEIR's mitigations to potential impacts due to earthquakes and soil disruption rely on state building codes, county disaster readiness, and geologic reporting. Again, I question the relevance and applicability of these measures to the enormous and highly specialized structures in this project.

## IMPACT 3.7-2

Possible Risks to People and Structures Caused by Strong Seismic Ground Shaking. The project site is in an area of high seismic activity, within a region that contains known active faults; therefore, proposed structures and employees could be subject to hazards from strong seismic ground shaking. However, given project compliance with California Building Code requirements, this impact would be less than significant.

Do California Building Codes exist specifically for wind turbines being used in this project?

Standard S-S1, Geologic Report Requirements, specifies that reports must be prepared consistent with County building regulations to address geologic hazards and geologic conditions, and these reports must be submitted for review of discretionary development and ministerial permits. Adherence to this standard would lessen potential environmental effects related to surface fault rupture, strong seismic ground shaking, and landslides. However, the possibility remains that strong seismic ground shaking could create risks to people or structures.

Who in the Humboldt County Planning Department has the expertise to review the accuracy and efficacy of these regulations and reports for a wind facility of this scale, on a site which is considered unique and problematic in the industry. I similarly question the following:

As shown in Table 3.7-3, most project site soils have a low to moderate shrink-swell potential (NRCS 2019). However, because of the large area and wide variety of soil types where construction of project components would occur, the conservative assumption for this assessment is that project components could be installed in areas where the expansion potential is moderate to high.

Volume changes of expansive soils can also result in consolidation of soft clays following the lowering of the water table or the placement of fill. Placing buildings or constructing infrastructure on or in unstable soils can result in structural failure.

To reduce effects on project site soils, the proposed project would comply with state and local regulations that require preparation of site-specific geotechnical investigations and implementation of all recommendations during project design and construction. The project would incorporate recommendations such as removing existing soils and replacing them with engineered fill, treating soils with lime, or installing post-tensioned slab foundations. These measures have been used successfully to reduce the potential for structural damage from expansive soils. Construction would be monitored in the field by a geotechnical or soils engineer to ensure that earthwork is performed as specified in the plans. Given project compliance with these state and local regulatory requirements, this impact would be **less than significant**.

#### **CLIMATE REFUGIA**

Not addressed in the environmental assessments, but of growing interest with awareness of the planet's rapidly accelerating loss of biodiversity, is the importance of biological refugia at risk from this project.

The concept of climatic refugia has been invoked for nearly two centuries to explain patterns of species distributions in the context of past climatic changes [6]. Understanding how Pleistocene refugia functioned in biodiversity maintenance and as sources for post-glacial re-colonization is important for developing a robust theory for contemporary conservation. We briefly review the theoretical framework for refugia, based in the Quaternary literature but with application to conservation (also see [7, 8, 9]).

Not only did refugia provide a safe haven during periods of unfavorable climate, but they served as sources for colonization following climate warming [10]. Other research has focused on characterizing refugia as "species pumps" that, due to their isolation and persistence, led to the development of new species and acted as biodiversity hotspots [11].

https://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0159909#pone.0159909.ref

Humboldt County's redwood ecosystem survived the ice ages because of the bioregion's temperate latitude and location between moderating maritime winds and moisture-trapping coastal mountains. This ecosystem has served as a refuge for species with some of the longest unbroken genetic lineages in the world. The species and cultural values at issue in the wind project area are testaments to that environment's long-standing biological diversity and productivity - the complex topography, climate characteristics, and vegetative patterns making it choice and protected habitat for species disappearing everywhere else.

#### **CARBON SEQUESTRATION**

Calculations of sequestration loss do not account for the long-term destruction of carbon-binding biological functions from grassland, forest, and soil alterations by this project.

Soil carbon storage is an important function of terrestrial ecosystems. Soil contains more carbon than plants and the atmosphere combined. Understanding what maintains the soil carbon pool is important to understand the current distribution of carbon on Earth, and how it will respond to environmental change. While much research has been done on how plants, free-living microbial decomposers, and soil minerals affect this pool of carbon, it is recently coming to light that mycorrhizal fungi—symbiotic fungi that associate with roots of almost all living plants—may play an important role in maintaining this pool as well.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mycorrhizal\_fungi\_and\_soil\_carbon\_storage

Thank you for your work and your attention.

Joyce King, 685 School Road, McKinleyville, Ca 95519 707-267-5409

From: Sharon Costello
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 12:03:59 PM

#### Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Sharon Costello From: Albert Del toro
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 12:06:31 PM

#### Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Albert Del toro

## To: Humboldt County Board of Supervisors - Khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us

From: Kristin Vogel, POB 453, Garberville, CA95542 (707)923-9284

# My GENERAL COMMENTS recommending No Project to the Humboldt Wind Energy Project

- \*The scale of this project is inappropriate for Humboldt County. The world's largest wind turbines (600 feet high) have no reliable history in any environment much less a remote, forested one situated on coastal ridges with fragile soil types located in the highest earthquake-prone area of California. There are too many severe and costly impacts related to this project to approve it in Humboldt County.
- \* Opposed by the Wiyot tribe. (Adam Canter from the Wiyot Tribe writes on Lost Coast Outpost https://lostcoastoutpost.com/2019/may/16/op-ed-wiyot-tribe-urges-people-cast-wary-eye-ridge/)
- \* County General Plan, tourism and agriculture brand is based on environmental responsibility, which this project is minimizing.
- \* Visible from Humboldt Redwoods State Park on the Thornton Multi-Use Trail, the Peavine Multi-Use Trail, The Peavine Ridge Spur at Prairie Road, parts of the Grasshopper Trail and Grasshopper Peak, all within the park areas of special natural significance.
- \* Towers and blinking red lights in line-of-sight will affect views from Fields Landing to Scotia. (figure 3.2-10 / page 3.2-23 and figure 3.2-4 / page 3.2-11) The EIR calls this potentially significant. (Impact 3.2-1, page 3.2-33)
- \* Monument Ridge (Mount Pierce 3,278 feet) was the base survey point for the Humboldt Survey in the 1850s because you can see it from every where on a clear day. https://books.google.com/books?id=Rbg-AAAAYAAJ&pg=PA5 (California's Redwood Wonderland, Humboldt County, Delmar L. Thornbury, Sunset Press, December 31, 1923, 167 pages.) Visible from Oregon and at sea offshore, along the Eel, Table Bluff, from Redway to the Marbles and up to the Airport. (White, C. Albert, 1983, 1991, A history of the rectangular survey system. Bureau of Land Management, Supt. of Docs. no.: I53.2:Su7/2 (https://www.blm.gov/sites/blm.gov/files/histrect.pdf)
- \* Rainbow Ridge at 3,400 feet is home to ancient forests. https://thelumberjack.org/2018/04/18/warriors-of-rainbow-ridge/ & https://alumni.berkeley.edu/california-magazine/just-in/2018-02-13/california-timber-battles-shift-new-grounds
- \* Light pollution (pages 3.2-26, 3.2-27, 3.2-63 & 3.2-64) Shadow flicker is dismissed because

there's more walls than windows (page 3.2-65) like no one works outside and tourists stay in houses.

- \* Highway 101 will be affected by construction and removal of gravel, bypasses, vegetation removal and grading wherever needed. And again at Decommissioning (but they didn't say).
- \* Only county roads will be repaired by developer, Highway 101 will be taxpayer cost to rebuild.
- \* This project will exceed \*NCUAQMD air quality\* standards. There is no way to mitigate the pollution. They're putting so much fossil fuel into the air to build this that it won't even meet our air quality standards. http://www.ncuaqmd.org/
- \* No guarantee of clean electricity. "The proposed project would not necessarily immediately replace electricity generated by fossil-fuel plants at the same quantity, and the project would generate a small amount of GHG emissions." (page 3.8-21)
- \* This project will use equipment too wide, high, heavy and long for California roadways 13 feet wide and up to 190 feet long. The California standard is 10 feet wide and 65 feet long. (page 3.12-3), sometimes in 30 truck convoys and at night. (sections 2 & 3.12 Transportation)
- \* Clear-cuts 100-feet wide for 25-miles from Jordan Creek to Bridgeville with Herbicide use here and around the turbines. Loss of CO2 sequestration in transmission line trees not considered.
- \* Mature trees and habitat from Fields Landing to Jordan Creek will be cleared or trimmed wherever it gets in the way. No surveys for animals or plants on the route to be cleared.
- \* Road suitability for removal of components. Overlooked and unmentioned industry standard blade and component replacement over the 30 year life of the project. The effects of decommissioning are put off to 30 years in the future.
- \* Seventeen miles of new 24-foot access roads closed to all but as needed workers for 30 years. If you're going to build 24-foot wide, perfectly paved roads, seriously, build them where they do some good for more than 15 permanent workers and a bunch of lizards. Seventeen miles would fix half the Wildcat-Mattole Road, leading to less greenhouse gas emissions while everyone creeps around the monster potholes at 10 mph.
- \*Changes will last longer than it would take a baby born this year to graduate college. Some parts will never be removed.

WILDLIFE — Sections 3.5 a (general wildlife) and 3.5 b (specific to project)

\* Project affects State Fully Protected Animals, other species of special concern, threatened and endangered animals, marine mammals, migratory birds, Species of Special Concern, Humboldt Bay habitat, the National Wildlife Refuge and Wiyot ancestral lands. (Section 3-5b) https://

www.wildlife.ca.gov/Conservation/SSC#394871319-how-are-sscs-addressed-under-thecalifornia-environmental-quality-act

- \*Plans will impact or take California State Fully Protected Species including: Brown Pelican (Pelecanus occidentalis californicus), Golden Eagle (Aquila chrysaetos), Bald eagle (Haliaeetus leucocephalus), White-tailed kite (Elanus leucurus), American peregrine falcon (Falco peregrinus anatum), Ring-tailed cat (Bassariscus astutus), and the California condor (Gymnogyps californianus). "Fully Protected species may not be taken or possessed at any time and no licenses or permits may be issued for their take except for collecting these species for necessary scientific research and relocation of the bird species for the protection of livestock." (https://www.dfg.ca.gov/wildlife/nongame/t\_e\_spp/fully\_pro.html)
- \* Project affects the reintroduction zone for the California Condor by the Yurok tribe. (page 3.6-41) (https://www.yuroktribe.org/departments/selfgovern/wildlife\_program/condor/condorproject.htm) Executive Summary Section ES 77 & ES 78 (6 month delay after release for any protection at all.) <a href="https://mailtribune.com/news/top-stories/condors-planned-for-release-innorthern-california-could-show-up-in-oregon">https://mailtribune.com/news/top-stories/condors-planned-for-release-innorthern-california-could-show-up-in-oregon</a>
- \* Company biologic models predict 300 dead birds a year, up to 114 raptors, up to 5% special status raptors (Cooper's hawk, sharp-shinned hawk, burrowing owl, ferruginous hawk, and northern harrier). (pages 3.5-109 & 110)
- \* Project is in known Marbled Murrelet flyway. The Marbled Murrelet was the catalyst for the Headwaters Deal and important to the Humboldt Redwoods Habitat Conservation Plan. Clearcut Gen-tie will open 25 miles of forest to raven predation. Mitigation suggested to reduce corvids has been implemented in other locations, but hasn't stabilized or increased murrelet populations. (page 3.5-78) A failed mitigation method is not mitigation. USFWS murrelet recovery guidelines were not followed or cited in the EIR. (page 3.5-78) Marbled murrelet impact stated to be "significant and unavoidable." (page 3.5-85)
- \* There are 33,213 acres of mature or old-growth spotted owl habitat within 0.7 miles of this project. (page 3.5-93) No data on how spotted owls do with turbines, this project would be a first in habitat.
- \* Turbine noise in the State Park and project footprint area with unknown effect on Townsend's long-eared bats, Spotted Owls, Marbled Murrelets and other wildlife. There are also Federal and State Endangered Species, Species of Special Concern and animals which have potential to be listed. Some were discussed in the dEIR, others were omitted (e.g. 2 of 3 SSC species of bats). <a href="https://www.dfg.ca.gov/wildlife/nongame/list.html">https://www.dfg.ca.gov/wildlife/nongame/list.html</a>

#### LEFT OUT OF EIR

- \* No exact faceplate information for turbines no ability to assess risk or noise. Different turbines behave and fail differently. (Section 2 and throughout)
- \* No exact locations/footprints for turbines. No way to judge actual localized effects. (page 3.7-16)
- \* No statement of the amount of fuel to be used to deliver turbine components. (3.1.6 Energy, page 3-13) Construction fuel is shown on a table and discussed, but transport fuel is omitted (3.1.6 Energy, page 3-13) and cannot be part of the total as the types of vehicles which use it are not shown on the tables.
- \* No Eelgrass survey. Old data from an agency on the only map they provide. (Figure 3.5-4 and page 3.5-171)
- \* No modeling of view or air quality from Humboldt Redwoods State Park. (page 3.2-1) State parks, and special natural zones within the park, should be added to EIR Figure 1, at present the name of the park is half cut off by the lower boundary of the map.
- \* No mention of 50-year old trees and landscaping (rhododendrons and azaleas) along 101 at Loleta Drive and other ramps just "trees and vegetation to be cleared." Obviously they won't grow back over the 30-year project life span. (Sections 2 & 3.12)
- \* No protocol level surveys for Spotted Owls. (Section 3.5b) Did not collect two years of data.
- \* No discussion of project relative to State Fully Protected Species, including the California Condor, Bald Eagle, Golden Eagle, Brown Pelican, White-tailed kite, American Peregrine falcon, Ring-tailed cat, and others known to occur at Fields Landing, at the National Wildlife Refuge and on the project footprint. Fully Protected Species cannot have "take permits" as no permit to take one is legally possible. (links above ^^^)
- \* No Timber Harvest Plan for the 100 foot-wide by up to 25-mile Gen-Tie corridor 300 plus acre clear cut

\* No accounting for delivery of the lift or erection cranes - by land or water, these also take 25 truckloads in specialized vehicles and trips to deliver. (North American Windpower, October 2013, <a href="https://edgarcountywatchdogs.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/07/evaluation-of-Apexdecommissioning-All.pdf">https://edgarcountywatchdogs.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/07/evaluation-of-Apexdecommissioning-All.pdf</a>)

\* No delivery or arrival method for cranes and other construction equipment: sea or land? How much fossil fuel? Early news reports said overland via 299 or 36; dEIR says nothing.

- \* No mention or studies of delivery effects on marine mammals or bald eagles, night herons, bats or other wildlife in the harbor and port.
- \* No mention or studies of night lighting and noise in Fields Landing, Jordan Creek staging area or ridgetop footprint. Lights for night operations could impact birds, bats, marine mammals, and local residents but are not mentioned in the EIR. They plan to work to 10 p.m. and sunset can be as early as 3 p.m. in winter. (page 2-21)
- \* No discussion of transport effects on residents in Fields Landing, Shively, Bear River Rancheria, Fernbridge, Ferndale, Fortuna, Rio Dell and Scotia, as well as unnamed communities along the delivery route; instead all were dismissed as the occasional house on a large lot, and not addressed as an impact. (Page 3.12-3)
- \* No listing of all bridges, overpasses, underpasses and grade crossings on Highway 101 which would be affected by transport and construction. Only some bypasses are given statements of need, some bridges to be gone over are of the same weight restrictions as bridge/s to bypass. The absence of a complete list does not give confidence that all obstacles to progress were adequately considered. (Section 2 page 2-25, section 3.12 https://humboldtgov.org/DocumentCenter/View/72214/30-31-Environmental-Setting-Impacts-and-Mitigation-Measures and the maps in Appendix M. https://humboldtgov.org/DocumentCenter/View/72237/MBiological-Resources-Wildlife-
- Assessment-Humboldt-County-Ca)
- \* No clue how long it will take to repair Highway 101 after the active transport phase. Bypasses go in and out, but then 101 itself will need repairs to right lane and shoulder from Fields Landing to Jordan Creek. This secondary impact is unaddressed in the EIR.
- \* No discussion of replacement supplies or components delivery methods or route changes.
- \* No decommissioning data. Just worry about that in 30 years, ktxbai. This is piecemealing. Making a project seem less than it is. There should at least be a description of the process and their best guess about how things come out of the county. Instead there's a brief mention without substance.
- \* No discussion of the effect on potential down-wind sites other than in technical discussion of the effect of drafting on other wind turbines in the array. (Standard E-S3, Item B, Humboldt County Plan, page 3.2-29) Down-wind effects: <a href="https://www.seas.harvard.edu/content/largescale-wind-power-would-require-more-land-and-cause-more-environmental-impact-thanpreviously">https://www.seas.harvard.edu/content/largescale-wind-power-would-require-more-land-and-cause-more-environmental-impact-thanpreviously</a>

#### TEMPORARY WORKERS in EIR

\* The number of temporary and permanent workers changes throughout the document. Assume 15 permanent and 300 or more temporary.

- \* The document assumes in one section that the county can absorb 300 specialized imported workers with housing and food, but that their arrival and departure will have no impact on the area. (Section 3.1.2 Population and Housing, page 3-8) A few sections later, it claims all 300 workers will be local and there will be therefore no impact. (Section 3.1.5 Public Services, page 3-11) It can't be both ways.
- \* Potable water for temporary workers is not mentioned. They would have a 20-fold-increase on the water demands than the 15 permanent workers at the water consumption rates given. (Section 3.1.3 Utilities, Water Supply, page 3-8)
- \* Temporary worker wastes are never mentioned. (3.1.3 Utilities, Wastewater, page 3-9)

#### **MAINTENANCE**

- \* No discussion of blade replacement other than by TerraGen spokesperson. Blades last 25 years, the project decommissions in 30. At least one blade replacement set per turbine (60x3 = 180) will be required over the life of the project and others may be required if blades fail. https://www.enr.com/articles/42352-are-four-wind-turbine-failures-in-five-weeks-too-many-for-nexteraenergy That they all need to be replaced by 25 years, and that is not mentioned in the EIR creates secondary impacts from the project and more deferred mitigation.
- \* Regular annual oil changes for each turbine were not really discussed in more than passing in this EIR. I learned that by reading about turbines from industry sites and videos https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=frYuXLTrM6w This process is automated and can cause no problems until the first time it does, at risk is 400 gallons of oil per turbine times 60 turbines each year, 24,000 gallons a year of maintenance oil. Leaking oil, which wasn't mentioned would create a secondary impact being that the ridges are the divides between the Eel and Bear Rivers.
- \* Gen-tie line maintenance would include herbicide use as would perimeter maintenance around other temporary and permanent facilities. Herbicides are mentioned only once in a table.
- \* Operational 4,000 pounds a week (0.28 ton/day) solid waste. That's factory level debris, not clean energy. (3.1.3 Utilities, Dry Waste, page 3-10)

## PERMANENT physical effects - Sections 1 & 2

- \* Concrete turbine pads and surrounding compaction zone (350x350 foot times 60) are permanent.
- \* Ten acre staging area scar from batch plant.
- \* Scars from 40 foot to 200 foot wide access roads, later regraded to 25 feet.

- \* Logged off bypasses on Highway 101.
- \* The DEIR claims less than significant impact on birds and bats with a permanent loss of 90.2 acres of forest woodlands, temporary loss of 464.3 acres of forest woodlands, permanent loss of 37.5 acres of grassland, temporary loss of 246.2 of grassland habitat, permanent loss of 0.7 acres of riparian habitat and temporary loss of 1.07 acres of riparian habitat (page 3.5-134). These are significant.

#### CONFLICTS WITH HUMBOLDT COUNTY GENERAL PLAN

There may be other conflicts with the Humboldt County Plan elements cited in this document besides these.

CO-G1 (page 3.2-28+)
Standard SR-G1 (page 3.2-28+)
Policy SR-P1 (page 3.2-28+)
Standard SR-S2 (page 3.2-28+)
Standard SR-S4 (page 3.2-28+)
Standard E-S3, Item B (page 3.2-28+)
Policy AG-P6 (page 3.3-8)
Policy FR-P8 (page 3.3-9)
Policy AQ-P9 (page 3.8-19)
Policy AQ-P11 (page 3.8-19)
Policy AQ-P17 (pages 3.8-19 & 20)
Standard AQ-S6 (pages 3.8-19 & 20)
Implementation Measure E-IM5 (page 3.8-20)

#### **CONFLICTS WITH TPZ & HCPs**

\* Timber Production Zones are supposed to take ten years to come out of zone, or have a special process and a payment to remove them. Habitat Conservation Plans (such as that with Humboldt Redwood Company) are meant to guide operations. Project needs to be in compliance with all laws, agreements and plans covering the footprint & transmission lines.

\*\* Timber land is not supposed to be taken for electrical generation purposes. \*\* (CALIFORNIA CODES GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 51100-51104 California Timberland Productivity Act of 1982. https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes\_displayText.xhtml? lawCode=GOV&division=1.&title=5.&part=1.&chapter=6.7.&article=1.)

SLUMPS, SLIDES, FIRES, FAILURES and COLLAPSES —

\*The EIR identifies steep slopes and unstable soils throughout the construction footprint. Cutting all the trees on the access roads in fall 2019 may result in landslides in rainy season. (Section 3.7 Geology & Soils)

- \* Out of area workers and oversized vehicles may cause grass or forest fires. One flicked cigarette, dragged chain or sparking electrical wire and this could be Paradise repeated. (Section 3.13 Fire)
- \* Wind turbines catch fire. Others have fallen down. Some have done both. Blades break and fall off. The risks of these events in a rural fire-prone area are greater than the EIR implies. (Google wind turbine fire for gory pictures, videos, and news articles)
- \* 10 foot deep circular foundations, up to and over 50 stories high in a seismically active (to 7.2 known magnitude) and fire-prone region in unstable soils on slopes to 10 percent. Major earthquakes on less than 20 year average separation. What could possibly go wrong?

#### WEATHER

- \* It is unlikely they can stay on schedule with a winter construction season. Even Humboldt Redwood slows or stops in season and these are the same lands and same tasks. The EIR states they would continue to log and work in winter, which is not permitted under the Humboldt Redwoods HCP. (page 3.5-187)
- \* Winter also influences the ability to ship over the bar into Humboldt Bay but no mention of adverse weather slowing or impeding the goal to finish by December 2020 (one full and one half winter seasons) is not mentioned.

#### **PUBLIC SAFETY**

- \* According to the wind energy industry advocacy group, wind turbine fires represent 10 to 30 percent of reported wind turbine accidents. No agency in Humboldt is equipped or able to fight a fire on a 50-story structure at 400 plus feet straight up.
- \* Damages to the right lane and shoulder of Highway 101 would put CHP and motorists at daily risk from uneven surfaces and rock throw until the Highway was repaired at least 18 months later plus the time to actually fix it (Hwy 36 is 3 years so far). This is an unaddressed secondary impact.

#### **DATA MODELING**

- \* The proposal suggests the tallest wind turbines in the US, so new that study data is not available for seismic risk and noise, plus no one knows how they'll perform once installed because there aren't any in North America yet. No data means modeling is not applicable.
- \* Modeling on animal species was damaged by incomplete data and unsupported assumptions.

#### **CONFUSING ALTERNATIVES**

\* Many alternatives are presented, however EIR does not provide breakouts of differences in Greenhouse Gas emissions or fossil fuels required to build the different foot-prints. In only one example: Riparian studies were not done at the Eel because they claim drilling underneath it would have no effect, however they have to have a staging area for bentonite containment materials and access somewhere. I don't see that they accounted for riparian habitat issues should they have to go over the Eel. Other examples abound. It is not possible to make a "better" choice based on the lack of input data for the alternatives.

#### A CLEAR ALTERNATIVE - SOLAR IS BETTER THAN WIND

\*Wind power raises the 2 meter surface air temperature as a result of the turbulent kinetic energy downwind of the turbine. At night when the ground cools by radiating heat into the sky, the turbine mixes warmer air aloft with the cool blanket of air next to the ground. Solar panels heat the surface air about 1/10th as much as wind turbines, by way of being darker than the ground i.e. having a higher albedo. So, lots of turbines means 1/2 degreeC or .9 degrees F temp increase that we wouldn't get with solar panel electricity. Wind is better than fossil fuel---but solar is the better.

http://keith.seas.harvard.edu/files/tkg/files/climatic impacts of wind power miller keith joule 2018 .pdf

#### **CARBON DIOXIDE**

- \*The amount of fuel stated is too low, thus the CO2 emitted in the first two years will be higher than stated. It's not going to really help the atmosphere or stop global warming at all.
- \*The calculations are incomplete; they omit the fossil fuel used in transportation. (3.1.6 Energy, page 3-13) The only diesel fuel listed is for turbine construction and does not include water/fuel delivery, logging or component transport into the harbor, fuel for log trucks, chainsaws, specialized transport vehicles, pace cars, garbage trucks and so on.
- \*The EIR regularly omits the effects of subcontractors. Simply buying services from someone else does not relieve the applicant of accounting for the effects of the effects of all parts of the project.
- \*The EIR brushes off the loss of trees carbon dioxide sinks to be removed for the GenTie and other construction as "they would have been cut anyway" under the Humboldt Redwoods HCP. Mitigation measure proposed for murrelets thinning canopies would also remove carbon sinks. (page 3.5-84) The loss of the forest Carbon capacity and the amount of carbon released by disturbing 3 million cubic feet of dirt should be added to the equation. (Section 3.8 Greenhouse Gas Emissions & Section 3.4 Air Quality)
- \* The calculations are amortized over 25 years. The reality is most of the CO2 will be released in the first 1.5 years by TerraGen and over an unknown amount of time by the state to repair 101 afterwards. (Section 3.8 Greenhouse Gas Emissions & Section 3.4 Air Quality)

\* By the time the equality of their 25-year-amortization equation kicks in, the 12-years-to-crisis point will be a six months in the past.

## **SPEED** is not always **ACCURACY**

- \* This document was prepared in a hurry. The natural areas studies are incomplete. The applicant wants subsidies for building these by December 2020. If anything is in the way, the plan calls for "clearcut, flatten and pave" with a rather "full speed ahead" gusto that suggests a fairly hefty payout awaits successful conclusion and that the laws and agreements here do not matter if they get in the way of the almighty dollar. One only has to see the hasty errors in section after section of the EIR to know the speed at which the work will be performed.
- \* "Finch Creek" exit as stated is actually Fernbridge exit. The number of workers changes. Some things are included in tables, and mentioned in the text, then forgotten in the mitigation. The name of the state park is cut off on Figure 1. The same figures are presented twice in Aesthetics. First it's ten species of bats, then 12, then back to 10 and finally they forgot to mention two of three species of special concern. The report looks and reads as if it were prepared at full speed and it lacks a full two years of species data.
- \* "Google Earth" was used to model old growth and mature trees." (page 3.5-79) LOL, really? Citations for method please.
- \* There simply isn't time to prepare final engineering drawings, and all the other documents that go with them and study the environment prior to doing final engineering simultaneously. But that is what is going to happen starting in September 2019 according to this EIR.
- \* The various project alternatives proposed for consideration are not separately modeled or described in the text. It is impossible to determine the best alternatives other than "no project" without being able to know the impacts, mitigation and results which would change based on the various alternatives.

#### **MITIGATION** is not intended to be **MINIMIZATION**

- \* Wind farms kill flying things. No one disputes this. Thirty years of wind farms have wiped out so many birds and bats that it's obviously an impact. And no, cats and windows don't kill condors, bald eagles, golden eagles, or many of the other species at risk. But wind farms do. What is not stated is any proactive effort to do things to benefit species. Three of the four bat species of special concern are mentioned once, and never mentioned again. (pages 3.5 128 +, page 3.5-134-136) No discussion about effects and no effort to mitigate for them.
- \* Wind farms are known to harm whole species. The EIR states that with no new generation capacity, existing wind farms will drive the Hoary Bat to extinction by 2050. (page 3.5-134) We are a hotspot for Hoary Bats perhaps one of the most significant parts of its range and will kill bats as stated in the EIR. I do not know how any "mitigation" is possible after realizing that new wind farms will hasten this species to extinction in an area which is known by their own survey

work to host this species. Money won't bring back the dead. Tourists don't come here to see dead things.

- \* Wind farms kill large, expensive flying things. Millions if not billions of tax payer dollars have been spent to save Bald Eagles, Golden Eagles, Condors, marbled murrelets, horned larks, and other interesting and special species which the EIR says will be killed and then offers some feeble minimization strategies, including trash can lids for Van Duzen County Park and discussions with the county of how to kill less, maybe.
- \* The mitigation sections are very weak. There is no habitat being purchased upfront, only an offer of purchases or conservation easements if problems occur and even that discussion won't start for a year or two after electricity is being produced.
- \* Mortality search areas and years of duration should be defined. At present, not defined.
- \* The DEIR did not analyze impacts on bats and invertebrate prey from the clearing habitat and use of herbicides.
- \* The Monument Ridge bat survey found more bats there. Areas of high bat use, should be excluded from consideration. (Appendix L *Acoustic Monitoring Report*, page 13, Table 3) www.wind-watch.org/video-allegheny.php
- \* Spotted owls use old growth and mature trees. The EIR states that some loss from project is "temporary" and will be revegetated for the owls. It will take more than our lifetimes for those trees to mature there is no possible way that the 546.8 acres will only be temporarily affected. (Impact 3.5-7, page 3.5-100)
- \* Data and mitigation omissions are frequent and curious. Species even those of special concern are shown on tables, or introduced, but then never mentioned in mitigation. Subsequently a conclusion is offered that the proposed mitigation measures will benefit everything and that replacement birds can be "created" by post-mortem meetings and trash can lids in a state park. Such is obviously not possible. (Section 3.5b)
- \* Even though Impact 3.5-16 claims construction disturbance would be less than significant; they just said that disturbance can result in bat roost abandonment, which may cause pup mortality which is significant.
- \* No mitigation measures were proposed for clearing habitat to create up to 17 miles of new roads or expansion of existing roads up to 200 feet wide (Table 2-1, Page 2-8)
- \* No mitigation was proposed for Western red-bat (SSC). Mitigation for taking adult Townsend's Big-eared Bats, was to suggest slashing the bases of old or old-growth trees to make fake nesting cavities. This was not supported by any scientific citations and would create a secondary impact.

\* Roadside and transmission line vegetation removal (including trees) should be held to the same standards and minimization measures as identified for vegetation removal within the Proposed Project area to ensure a less than significant impact on birds and bats.

#### LAST AND CERTAINLY NOT LEAST

\* There is no way to get a take permit for California Fully Protected Species - including the California Condor - except for research or livestock protection. This project is neither, and this is not discussed in the EIR. If it is illegal for an individual to take a member of a Fully Protected Species then by current U.S. law, it is equally illegal for a corporation. I request the California Department of Fish and Game to enforce their laws equally on corporations and individuals (https://www.npr.org/2014/07/28/335288388/when-did-companies-become-people-excavating-the-legalevolution).

# Examination whether this project fulfills stated project goals and Humboldt County policies:

#### •Tax credits to TerraGen if built before December 2020:

**Yes.** Profits and tax credits will go out of Humboldt to the developers LLC and the New York investment company. Please see comment by investor <a href="https://www.usnews.com/opinion/blogs/nancy-pfotenhauer/2014/05/12/even-warren-buffet-admitswind-energy-is-a-bad-investment">https://www.usnews.com/opinion/blogs/nancy-pfotenhauer/2014/05/12/even-warren-buffet-admitswind-energy-is-a-bad-investment</a>

## •Statewide portfolio renewable and volatility:

**No.** Project provides 0.005% of California's renewable power generation according to this document. For this, at least 1,058,658 gallons of diesel will burn over 18 months of construction. Transportation gas was not broken out, nor was oceanic transport costs and delivery of specialized cranes and other equipment.

## Promote sustainable energy in Humboldt County:

**No.** Continues purchases of transmitted grid power.

## **Create 155 MW green energy**

- •No. By the time the electrons get to Bridgeville, planned losses to transmission are 12% of generation. Thus 20MW will vanish and the result will be 135MW maximum.
- •No. Besides planned transmission losses, mitigation measures for flying things do not include shut downs and slow downs, further reducing the power generated to an unknown level.

## •Displace 372K MT/yr of CO2 that would otherwise be required to generate 155MW with natural gas

Yes, but significant and incompletely calculated emissions occurring in the first year and a half and amortized over 25 years to hide their true effects on the environment. Greenhouse gasses should be accounted for accurately. Millions of gallons of diesel fuel are going to burn in Humboldt County. Air quality will be exceeded. The CO2 is going up in 2019 and 2020, not in little chunks over the 25 years. While this may fulfill some form of bureaucratic checklist from the standpoint of global warming it's a huge lie. The CO2 goes up now, in the 12 years it needs to be at its lowest.

#### Near transmission infrastructure:

**No.** It's 20 miles South of Eureka, 12 miles South East of Fortuna, 22 miles North of Garberville and just South of Scotia. The Bridgeville substation is 25 miles from the project site and 44 miles from Eureka.

## •Employment:

**Unclear and variable numbers** in the EIR, at most 300 temporary plus 15 permanent jobs by imported employees who may rotate. Transportation workers seem to have been omitted. In contrast, the Eureka McDonalds employs 30 people, Target about 65-125 people, Blue Lake Casino more than 100, and so on up to the larger employers including St. Joseph Hospital (900+), and Humboldt State University (1400+). Adding 15 jobs for 30 years is statistically insignificant even in Humboldt County.

## • Promote walkable cities and alternative transport.

**No.** The entire project is rural. Everyone will drive everything and themselves.

#### •Tax revenue:

Miniscule. TerraGen leases, not owns.

The tax is stated to be 1 percent of total cost less deductibles, thus at most around \$2.5m annually, 14% into General Fund with the remainder to schools and other funds. An additional \$7 million would be paid during construction. (TerraGen slide show) This amount is so small compared to the amount of staff and legal time that the tax revenues may not displace early costs for years to come. Tax revenues will not pay for the damaged Highway 101, the state of California will have to do that - the developer only offers to repair county roads damaged in transport and construction.

### Provide environmentally safe power (County goal)

**No.** Entire construction is fossil fuel powered, transportation fuels were not included, and the accounting method amortized this greenhouse gas injection over 25 years - greenwashing the project.

**No.** Clearing is 895 acres of a carbon sink forest habitat alone; 759 acres will be replanted and planned to regrow for 30 years. By then, the project will have to be decommissioned, and much of this area may have to be cut down again to get the stuff out. We don't know - decommissioning statements are put off until 30 years from now. The nearly 900 acres of forest cutover alone **is greater than the entire area needed to replace the proposed 155 MW project with local solar.** 

**No.** There are at least two places where the applicant discusses plans to knowingly violate existing laws and agreements. (1) Plans to ignore the Humboldt Redwoods HCP regarding winter work, and (2) Plans to take California Fully Protected species for which no permits or licenses are available.

THE BOOK GROTING		10. 140 1 10,000	
The best allema	tive for this project i	is, ivo Projeci	

## Electronically Submitted Comments are Essential for Economy, Efficiency, Accuracy, Information Retrieval and Authenticity

To require 10 copies of all comments in an electronic age is clearly an attempt to stymie voices of people who do not have the means to hire staff or copying services. The 10-copy requirement is onerous, undemocratic, punitive, expensive, and favors the applicant, and must somehow violate a legal statute or three. Clearly it's the county's way of holding back, or at least punishing, opposition to the project.

This requirement also packs and obscures the administrative record making it difficult to find and corroborate information, and to ensure that all comments have been included in their entirety. It lends itself to misleading and inaccurate summaries by biased editors.

Consequently, we will be submitting comments electronically.

Greg King, Ken Miller, Dan Berger, Michael Evenson, Ellen Taylor, Ellin Beltz, Dave Grant, Jesse Noell

I am writing out of concern for the form that has been dictated for communicating with the Supervisors concerning the windmill project. In brief, requiring nine copies and an original draft is a challenge, one which, in the time it will take to comply, presents an impediment to the essential purpose of the effort. This is to exercise a citizen's right to freely express concerns over some aspect of civic engagement. We feel this is a process that requires more, not less ease in realizing, especially at a time when greater and more prompt engagement is made possible by evolving technology. It could be interpreted as an effort to impede the success of one opinion or another in a public debate.

I must urge you to work with your fellow Supervisors to develop and implement a new, less politically suppressive form as soon as possible.

Thank you for your time and attention.

Best,

David Simpson Jane Lapiner From: Akin Babatola
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 9:19:48 AM

#### Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Akin Babatola From: Werner, Steve

To: <u>Lippre, Suzanne; Elizabeth Burks</u>
Subject: FW: Terra-Gen Wind Power Project
Date: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 10:34:53 AM

Attachments: <u>image001.png</u>

From: Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 9:09 AM

**To:** Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve <SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bass, Virginia <VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex <RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Fennell, Estelle <EFennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Wilson, Mike <Mike.Wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve <smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>

**Subject:** FW: Terra-Gen Wind Power Project

FYI

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board County of Humboldt (707) 476-2396 khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us



From: Sylvia Jutila <<u>sylvia.jutila@gmail.com</u>>
Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 9:06 AM
To: Hayes, Kathy <<u>KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>

Subject: Terra-Gen Wind Power Project

Board of Supervisors Humboldt County

I am writing to voice our opposition to the proposed Terra-Gen wind power project.

#### These are our reasons:

- 1. The huge concrete structures will be outdated within 20 years and then taking them down and disposing of them will be a huge expense. Do the taxpayers cover that also? Of course!
- 2. There are new technologies being developed that will replace conventional systems. One is a project designed by a physicist at Utah State University, another is a sealed generator project that would be buried, being developed in Oregon. I am sure there are more.

- 3. Solar power is available now, it is much cheaper, doesn't destroy birds, bats, insects and our beautiful environment.
- 4. An engineer told me some of their bat/bird safe guards are more dangerous to the power system than they want people to know about.
- 5. Here are two excellent articles about the truth of wind generators:

https://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2018/10/181004112553.htm

https://www.technologyreview.com/s/612238/wide-scale-us-wind-power-could-cause-significant-warming/

6. Not only will the project damage the natural beautify of Monument and Bear River Ridges, but what about the lines going out to Bridgeville, and their required clearance of trees and bushes, along a river that tends to flood on a fairly regular basis.

I am sorry that we cannot attend hearings or rallies, my husband suffered a stroke in November. We did want you to know of our great opposition to this project.

George and Sylvia Jutila, 3655 Rohnerville Road, PO Box 606, Fortuna, CA 95540 707-834-4294,

From: Werner, Steve

To: <u>Lippre, Suzanne</u>; <u>Elizabeth Burks</u>

Subject: FW: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 10:35:37 AM

Attachments: <u>image001.png</u>

From: Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 8:51 AM

**To:** Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve <SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bass, Virginia <VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex <RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Fennell, Estelle <EFennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Wilson, Mike <Mike.Wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve <smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Subject: FW: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

Fyi.

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board County of Humboldt (707) 476-2396 khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us



From: John Butler < John.Butler.260638069@p2a.co >

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 8:50 AM **To:** Hayes, Kathy < <u>KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, John Butler From: Patrick Boileau

To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 8:40:45 AM

#### Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Patrick Boileau

# Honorable Supervisors,

I would like to provide comments on the proposed Terra Gen project south of Rio Del.

While the concept of alternative energy may be considered a lofty goal, this project fails to meet basic standards of common sense and environmental protections on several levels many of which have been already brought to your attention and I will not focus on here.

The two issues I have not seen adequately addressed is the well documented fact that earthworms are susceptible to the seismic vibrations directly related to the windmill operations and migrate away from the area. This causes a decline in soil productivity and food support for various wildlife and domestic species.

The other matter that I find unacceptable is there is absolutely no assurances that the concrete slabs and related tower structures will be removed, and the area restored once it becomes necessary to do so. As I understand it, the corporation submitting the construction application is not the same that will be operating the project and ultimately responsible for the windmills that will become unreliable and derelict. In other words, a common corporate shell game will likely result in a small bankrupt corporation owning the remnants of the infrastructure once it becomes to expensive to maintain.

We saw many, many of these derelict windmills, some only 10-15 years old, littering the landscape of Ireland in a visit this past summer. We spoke at length with a fair number of Irish people that had grown weary of these projects and a recent windmill project had been denied permitting for the reasons mentioned above and many others.

Until the long-term effects of the seismic vibrations and other in-ground organisms can be documented and evaluated as well as the responsibility of removing derelict windmill towers and restoring the site can be clearly defined through a bond, prior to approval, this project should be denied.

Thank you

Uri Driscoll

From: Werner, Steve

To: <u>Lippre, Suzanne; Elizabeth Burks</u>
Subject: FW: TerraGen Wind Project 12/9/19
Date: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 10:40:15 AM

From: Eberhardt, Brooke <BEberhardt@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 8:39 AM

To: BOS <Unknown>; Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve

<SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>

**Subject:** FW: TerraGen Wind Project 12/9/19

Hello,

Please see below for public comment.

Brooke Eberhardt
Deputy Clerk of the Board of Supervisors
County of Humboldt
825 Fifth Street, Room 111
Eureka, CA 95501
707.476.2385

**From:** Dave Grant <<u>mattolecraftsman@gmail.com</u>>

Sent: Monday, December 9, 2019 10:54 PM

**To:** Eberhardt, Brooke < <u>BEberhardt@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>

Subject: Fwd: TerraGen Wind Project 12/9/19

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Dave Grant** < mattolecraftsman@gmail.com >

Date: Mon, Dec 9, 2019 at 12:31 PM Subject: TerraGen Wind Project 12/9/19

To: Bass, Virginia < <u>Vbass@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>, Bohn, Rex < <u>rbohn@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>, Madrone,

Steve <<u>smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>, Wilson, Mike <<u>mike.wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>,

efennell@co.humboldt.ca.us <efennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Dear Humboldt County Board of Supervisors,

I am opposed to the TerraGen Wind Project, you know this, you have heard it from me several times. I stand with the Wiyot tribe, we have the responsibility to preserve our wild and undeveloped land.

We know that if the turbines are to be built the endangered Marbled Murrelets will be killed by 600 foot machines. We know the blades will knock federally protected Bald and Golden Eagles from the sky. We know there will be a significant impact on the Hoary Bat population. We know that the 300+ yards of concrete for each turbine will always be on the ridge.

What we don't know is that if we don't install these turbines the planet will overheat, the oceans will rise, we will have mass extinction. This wind turbine project can not guarantee any of that from not happening. What it can guarantee is death and destruction of endangered and protected species and also Humboldt Counties claim to be 100% renewable by 2025. Destroying these sacred ridges is not worth the claim. There are other ways to become a self sufficient renewable energy producing county.

Another thing we don't know is how these tall towers (with spinning blades with a diameter of 450 feet) will do in an earthquake. There have not been studies done in environments similar to Bear River and Monument Ridges. We also have not been told how the 225 foot blades will be dealt with after being decommissioned. We are allowing TerreGen to use our ridges as a test site. The risk is too high, we can do better.

Humboldt County is unique, we have undeveloped open and forested spaces. It is a sanctuary for thousands of species of animals, birds, insects and more. Places like this are far and few between. Our planet is being changed rapidly by humans and their need to expand and thrive. We have lost the knowledge of living with the Earth, now we seem to only destroy it. We are facing the crisis of biodiversity extinction and climate breakdown. Fact is this project will contribute to the biodiversity extinction of our planet. It does not guarantee a solution to our climate crisis. We need to preserve habitat and conserve biodiversity. Only nature can create this and it is too easy for humans to destroy and manipulate it.

I live in Petrolia, I know what is like to be surrounded by nature, that is why I am so strongly opposed to this wind project. It is industrialization on a massive scale. It fuels industry, creates manufacturing jobs and these machines are high maintenance. It does nothing for our planet. Industrial wind energy is not green energy. People all over the world are realizing this.

California is 30% renewable energy now. Solar provides more than twice the amount of energy than wind. Solar doesn't require new infrastructure or roads or new transmission lines or massive equipment to install. Solar provides jobs for local installers. Solar is individually owned. Solar can be financed for the cost of the energy being produced.

Please oppose this project.

Sincerely,

David Grant Petrolia, CA

--

dave.grant petrolia.ca

From: Werner, Steve

To: <u>Lippre, Suzanne</u>; <u>Elizabeth Burks</u>

Subject: FW: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 10:42:03 AM

Attachments: <u>image001.png</u>

From: Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 8:16 AM

**To:** Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve <SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bass, Virginia <VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex <RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Fennell, Estelle <EFennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Wilson, Mike <Mike.Wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve <smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Subject: FW: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

FYI

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board County of Humboldt (707) 476-2396 khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us



From: Mike lebenbaum < Mike.lebenbaum.260625216@p2a.co >

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 7:59 AM **To:** Hayes, Kathy < <a href="mailto:KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us">KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us</a>>

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Mike lebenbaum From: <u>Michael Evenson</u>
To: <u>Hayes, Kathy</u>

**Subject:** RE: Board consideration of TerraGen Wind Project

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 9:53:16 AM

Attachments: ALL SIDES NOW 11 7 19.docx

ALL SIDES NOW 11 19 19.docx

TG Comment Ltr 1.pdf TG Comment Ltr 2.pdf

Please include the following attachments in the Board Packet and Official Record.

Thank you, Michael

Michael Evenson

Lost Coast Ranch® Petrolia, California 707-629-3506

## **RE: Denial Humboldt Wind Project Permit**

Humboldt County Supervisors Estelle Fennell, Rex Bohn, Steve Madrone, Virginia Bass and Mike Wilson,

I'm writing to detail my opposition to the Terra Gen wind generator construction project which has come to the Board for consideration, and concerning which you are expected to make determination in the next week. As you know the Humboldt County Planning Commission after careful study and examination of documents, analytic material, including letters and public comment from county inhabitants, has recommended that you reject it. Since examining such projects as Terra Gen's proposal is part of the mandate of the Planning Commission, in a sense your work has been done for you. Please, then, weigh their decision seriously.

#### **GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSION**

The project was originally taken into consideration by the RCEA as a way to address the looming climate catastrophes caused by ever-increasing greenhouse gases (GG) in our planet's atmosphere. However, Terra-Gen's wind generation proposal for our county DOES NOT ADDRESS THIS ISSUE, which was the sole purpose of RCEA's original interest in it.

"It is not possible to state that operation of the project would directly replace energy generated by fossil fuel fired plants"- is Terra Gen's statement addressing GG emissions in section 4.4.7 of their proposal.

On the contrary, the project, if realized, will not only contribute GG to the planetary atmosphere in the process of its construction, and in the removal of the GG sequestration potentials already existing on the site, such as forests and soils, but also by generating profits for Terra Gen, whose owner, Energy Capital Partners, will use them to capitalize its multiple fossil fuel development subsidiaries, such as Targa Resources, Triton Power Partners, US Development Group, Summit Mainstream Partners, Calpine, and a vast array of other investments.

The climate for expansion of the fossil fuel industry is currently favorable and appears likely to remain so. RCEA's intention was not to subsidize it. The Terra Gen project does not meet RCEA's objective of reducing atmospheric GGs. This fact obviates the entire project.

It is not a question of ideology. Humboldt County needs to find ways of decreasing GG emissions which do not have the opposite effect.

Opponents of the Terra Gen project have been accused of NIMBYism.

However, regarded from a global perspective, project supporters are actually the NIMBYs, as they are focused strictly on Humboldt County's own emissions: Renewable Portfolio Standards requirements, and meeting California's demand for 50% renewables by 2030. Since the atmosphere is contiguous however, the project will increase GGs in our own atmosphere as well as the rest of the world's.

Therefore, we will continue to be "part of the problem" rather than "part of the solution."

"Overriding Considerations", are offered to cancel the project's unavoidable impacts. They include the putative GG savings, such as replacements of outdated energy sources like the Klamath and Potter dams, the displacement of 384,068 tons of GG generated by fossil fuels, output of .099 power plants in 1 year, the fuel consumption of 48,973,382,083 smartphones in 1 year.

The "clean energy" generated is also compared to carbon sequestration factors such as the amount of carbon which might be withdrawn from the atmosphere by 6,350,643 seedlings grown for 10 years.

There is no parallel analysis however of what the profits to Energy Capital, subsidized by Humboldt County, will accomplish.

Will the money be invested in Triton Power Partners, to purchase MODI trailers for deionized water? Will it finance Summit Mainstream to expand in the Bakken shale oilfields? Or pay for another pipeline as part of a Targa resources project?

In other words, the enterprises related to Humboldt County's wind generator project include Energy Capital Partner's other projects. They must be identified and their GG outputs must be quantified. If the wind project is going to be employed as a carbon credit for the applicant's GG-generating projects around the world, this reality must be part of the Planning Commission's report.

#### OTHER CLAIMED OVERRIDING BENEFITS

Repairs and replacement of PG&E's power lines and systems is listed as a benefit which overrides the unavoidable impacts of the project. It has certainly been demonstrated that the electrical power distributions systems for which PG&E is responsible have caused horrific damage because of their condition. However, to pay for PG&E'S mismanagement and negligence by allowing the cost to be taken out of our county's natural resources and public trust values is medieval. It is a benefit to PG&E, not to the people who are dependent upon their services. It certainly is not an "overriding consideration".

## BIOLOGICAL AND ETHICAL UNAVOIDABLE IMPACTS

As you may know 1 million species are predicted by respected scientists to become extinct in the next decade or so. Some of these species reside in Humboldt County.

There has always been a contingent of the population which does not value biodiversity. A couple of decades ago one could see bumper stickers on the road which told people to "roast a spotted owl for dinner". However, the country as a whole did not share in this delight. Scientists actually continued to mourn species which humans had driven to extinction, such as the passenger pigeon.

The endangered species act still exists though the agencies mandated to defend it are embattled. It is alarming to hear certain local scientists referring to endangered species casualties caused by the wind generators as "only a few birds." The mitigations proposed for threatened species loss are pitiful, as exemplified by putting lids on garbage cans to discourage corvids. Lids should be on garbage cans and park staff or county staff should provide that service. The public should be educated.

This mitigation is also medieval. The cost of cleaning up our garbage should not be charged to our public trust resources.

20 plants which the Terra Gen tribe offered to the Wiyot tribe as mitigation for the desecration of Wiyot prayer ridges is worse than medieval, it resonates with the mockery of a Nero.

Melanie McCavour, one of the Humboldt County Planning Commissioners, described some of the rare and precious life forms in Humboldt County. She described the probable reaction of the international community to the destruction we are threatening to inflict on this natural splendor with our fear-driven project. It will be one of amazement and horror. This will be the same reaction as world opinion expressed to MAXXAM's destruction of our ancient redwood forests.

MAXXAM then sold a fraction of their redwoods back to the public for the same price that it had paid for the entire 210,000 acres. Will the Terra Gen wind project, whose projected lifespan is similar to MAXXAM's history in Humboldt, have a similar end?

The project is crazy, as Ms. McCavour described it. It is another frenzy of self-destruction similar to the MAXXAM catastrophe. The world will be angry and we will deserve their anger, because the impacts to our dwindling biodiversity and ethnodiversity are not mitigatable.

There cannot be any overriding considerations.

Terra Gen proponent Natalynne De Lapp has stated frequently in her presentations that "we all want our conveniences" as if we are incapable of any self – control. This has been historically proven time and time again not to be true.

Reducing our GG productions will require some consciousness of the planetary effects of climate breakdown. This will not develop if we simply sell off our resources to a company whose profits come from developing fossil fuels. An educated public will be capable giving those 48 + billion cellphones a rest, and leaving some of those 384000 tons of fossil fuels in the ground.

There is no benefit to the people of Humboldt County in going forward with this project. There is no benefit to the world. Please reject it.

Very Truly Yours

Ellen Taylor

Chairperson, Lost Coast League PO Box 60, Petrolia California 95558

Ellen & Tayk

From: Frank Bacik

To: Hayes, Kathy; Bohn, Rex; Fennell, Estelle; Wilson, Mike; Bass, Virginia; Madrone, Steve

Subject: request for consideration of appropriate venue for appeal from denial of Terra-Gen / Humboldt Wind project

**Date:** Tuesday, November 26, 2019 4:07:48 PM

## Madam Clerk and Members of the Board of Supervisors:

I respectfully request that the Clerk be directed to locate **an alternative venue** which will fairly facilitate full, reasonably foreseeable, public participation, in fairness to those who may be adversely affected by the project's implementation.

I write in connection with the recent Appeal from the Planning Commission's **Denial** of the following:

- an Application for Conditional Use Permit;
- Certification of the Final EIR:
- A Statement of Overriding Considerations; and
- a proposed mitigation and monitoring program.

Each denial was for the massive "Humboldt Wind" Turbine Power Generation proposal. On appeal, the proponents seek authorization for the single largest excavation and grading, road and landing construction, oversize component transport, power distribution and Timberland Conversion operation ever considered by this Board, anywhere in Humboldt County..

As a consequence of the extraordinary project scope, there has been an enormous amount of public interest and concern regarding the review process. This is Particularly true because the FEIR has identified seven separate categories of significant, unmitigated, adverse, "unavoidable" direct and cumulative environmental impacts, which county staff has determined will result from project implementation. Moreover, Staff has recommended a Statement of Overriding Considerations to support a determination that *no matter the harm*, this project can be allowed to go forward with all its unmitigated adverse impact, and all its admitted harm.

Over 2,000 pages of public comments were presented to county staff, and months of additional review followed publication of the DEIR, yet *not even one* of the categories of unavoidable significant adverse impact has been mitigated to less-than-significant. I believe these factors have combined such that many more citizens will turn out to participate and contribute to public comment than is usual for a land use project. We can expect many more as the Appeal ensues.

Clearly, as reported in the press after each hearing, night after night after night the Supervisors Chambers have been over-filled, with dozens of citizens turned away from the hearing room by sheriffs' deputies to the courthouse lobby and an adjacent conference room; and still, scores of people had to attend the long hearing without seats on which to rest, or loud and clear sound reinforcement with which to hear the proceedings. The Supervisors' Chambers is simply not an adequate or appropriate venue for the Appeal from the Planning Commission's Denials in this case. Another, larger and better equipped venue should be located and reserved for the public

hearings on the appeal.

This is not an unusual or unnecessary request. Venues such as the Warfinger Building, the Adorni Center, the Veterans' Memorial or the Sweasy Building (Arkley performance center) in Eureka, the CR playhouse theater south of town, the Van Duzer theater in Arcata at HSU or the Old Steeple theater in Ferndale are often closed and empty on weekdays. An effort should be made to see if the Appeal hearings can be venued at on of those convenient facilities.

Many of the attendees over the last few hearings leading to the Permit Denial are elderly or have limited ability to navigate the court house or to stand in the lobby for four of five hours trying in vain to hear a tinny decades-old PA speaker. These interested persons, many of whom are property owners for whom the project poses a real threat of permanent f damage, have *due process rights* in the proceedings, even if they are not applicants, Those rights are abridged by the technique of limiting each speaker to 60 seconds to express their views and "freezing them out" of the process by having deputies exclude them from the Chamber and forcing them out into the lobby where there are no are no seats.

Thank you for your attention to this important matter.

Frank

Frank Shaw Bacik, JD
President, Dir. Legal Affairs
Town of Scotia Company, LLC.
108 Main Street
PO Box 245 Scotia CA 95565
fbacik@townofscotia.com
Office Ph. 707-764-4131

Office Fx. 707-764-4150 Cell Ph. 707-845-4995 www.townofscotia.com

Richard Gienger Box 283, Whitethorn California 95589 Phone: 707-223-6474 9 December 2019

RE: Comments in Opposition to the Ill-conceived Terra-Gen Industrial Wind Speculation

To the Humboldt Board of Supervisors, the People of Humboldt County, and the North Coast

Dear Supervisors and People:

There is sound, on-point, strong and valid opposition to this half-baked speculative project, which was thrown on the fast-track for approval without essential thought and consideration of the past and future of the county and region – wrapped in the banner of fighting climate change ASAP. There has been plenty of testimony and evidence that refutes that hugely inflated claim. The speculators thought they could best cram the project through the Planning Commission like a lot line adjustment or a new business on the Avenue-of-the-Giants. Who could argue? Lots of money and jobs AND electricity from the wind to save humankind.

This "controversial" project, believe it or not, is the historical replication of bad choices made in haste, and with devastating effects on the People, Land, Water and Wildlife of the North Coast – basic colonial hubris, if you will. An elementary read of Ray Raphael's History of Humboldt County – One Land Two Peoples, in particular, the chapter co-authored by Freeman House gives you that understanding. Some might contend that modern times are more enlightened and truth-based. I have personally observed more than forty years of unacceptable damage to the forests and watersheds of the North Coast, following decades of extreme "legacy" problems. Adequate steps for recovery have yet to be taken. I am not making this up. I and others have been honored for their recovery efforts, both on the ground and in reforming standards for protection and conservation.

I will give you a very few examples of many so-called dominant paradigm resource abuses, and false rationalizations, that the Terra-Gen proposal would continue:

- \*\* In 1985, in the California Court of Appeals ruling in EPIC v. Johnson, the court found that CDF (now CalFire) was, required to, and had not considered cumulative impacts, nor adequately consulted with Indian People, and not provided adequate assurances that Native American Heritage was being protected. The decision has yet to be truly implemented.
- \*\* As a result of the 1996-97 New Year's storms, California State resource protection entities declared Bear, Stitz, Jordan, and Freshwater Creeks and Elk River as significantly, individually and cumulatively, adversely impacted by sediment. Adequate corrective measures have yet to be taken, with only Elk River having continuing and vocal support.
- \*\* By way of trust in the truth being revealed and acted on: The 300,000 cubic yards of soil and debris torrenting into the Eel River from Bear Creek was deemed an insignificant impact by both CDF/CalFire and a local court. On top of that, and even included in the final Headwaters Deal documents, was a completely false survey of Bear Creek stream conditions after the torrent.
- \*\* The impacts in Jordan Creek, though of a smaller scale, were similar AND it is in this watershed that Terra-Gen wants to make a two hundred feet-wide construction highway.

I could go on with a lot more examples, like the Redway Stable Slopes Timber Harvest Plan that took a Trinity County judge to overturn for failure to consider cumulative impacts. This after PL/Maxxam tried to cobble rationales together after originally submitting the plan with no mention of an earlier plan that triggered a landslide that, for a time, blocked the South Fork of the Eel River, damaging property and endangering residents in lower Redway. Gosh, really should bring up the deranged hillslope hydrology cited by Professor Donald Grey that precipitated the torrent that swept through Stafford. It was a miracle that no lives were lost.

This Terra-Gen speculative proposal, with huge actual, adverse and unconsidered impacts needs immediate and final denial. Finding the climate & energy & stewardship future for Humboldt County needs to be seriously undertaken – and not avoided by allowing a damaging speculative boondoggle to be imposed.

Sincerely,

Richard Gienger

From: <u>ernieorjudy</u>
To: <u>Hayes, Kathy</u>

Subject: Terra-Gen"s probably upcoming appeal to you of Planning Commission"s decision to deny a permit.

**Date:** Monday, November 25, 2019 11:39:37 PM

Dear Kathy: Thank you for being so responsive to my requests to forward my thoughts on Terra-Gen's proposal. Please see that each County Supervisor gets a copy of this email. Thank you very much. Regards, Ernie DeGraff

### Dear County Supervisors:

The following are my comments and concerns should Terra-Gen (T-G) decide to appeal the Planning Commission's (PC) decision to deny a permit for their proposed project. If Terra-Gen appeals the PC's decision to deny a permit for the project, I feel you should uphold the PC's decision to deny a permit for their proposed project.

I watched the last two meetings of the Planning Commission. Most of the comments by the public were against the project. And I feel that some of the impacts "necessary" for Terra-Gen to do the project but which are unmitigatable, just doom the project. And their EIR is grossly lacking in analyzing the environmental and Tribal effects.

Terra-Gen's proposal will not make even the smallest dent in "climate change". I'm convinced that the science shows that changes in climate have been around since the beginning of time. And that man's influence is a very miniscule part of what's going on. I'm more concerned about the health of people that live in cities like Beijing, etc. that suffer from man-made pollution. I feel that the "climate changers" twist the science to fit their "agenda", whatever that might be. Being a conservative, I side with those that think changes in climate are primarily part of the natural cycle of things that are way out of "our" control. The folks that really know what's going on are the meteorologist scientists with the data to back up their view of "climate change" (read some of the articles on the internet that refute "climate change").

Now I can't change yours or others minds on "climate change", but thought you should know where I stand and why. Someone at the last meeting said that T-G was a LLC, and you know what that is. Their venture capitalists' backing is to make money and spend as little as possible on this project (old out-of-date turbines; not state of the art). And at the end of the 30 year "life" of the project, Terra-Gen will just turn away and leave the remnant turbines and environmental damage (roads, clearcut transmission corridors, towers and electrical lines) for us citizens to gasp at and wonder why "you Supervisors" let them build it, should you overturn the Planning Commission's decision to deny the permit. Lawsuits will immediately follow, and time will run out on T-G before the end of the year, resulting in T-G's backers not receiving funds from the Federal Govt., since that "gift" will expire at the end of the year. This proposed project is a financial scam at the expense of us "dumb" folks residing behind the "redwood curtain". So there it is as far as I'm concerned. And, worse case scenario, should the project proceed to completion (which I think is doubtful due to lawsuits and stays which the courts

will approve) you Supervisors will be responsible for all the negative unmitigatable environmental effects and what's "left over" for us citizens to look at on Monument and Bear River ridges. And you can't bring back all the "critters" that will be killed by those revolving propellers. So, may the Lord have mercy on all the wildlife and human strife, including you Supervisors, that will suffer if this project is approved. Regards, Ernie DeGraff, Fortuna

From: <u>Daniel Berger</u>

To: Hayes, Kathy; Bohn, Rex; Fennell, Estelle; Wilson, Mike; Bass, Virginia; Madrone, Steve

Subject: Comment on Humboldt Wind Project

Date: Monday, December 9, 2019 9:50:52 AM

To Humboldt Board of Supervisors, In the hope that you can be as informed as possible I have sent the following links to websites related to the energy issue. In my opinion effectively rezoning to an industrial area what should be a World Heritage Site would be an injury to Humboldt County and all of its residents. The notion that we will be stopping climate change is just a sales pitch. The amount of CO2 saved would be not even the amount produced by one new Boeing GE90 series Aircraft engine. <a href="http://www.bangaloreaviation.com/2009/10/worlds-largest-aircraft-engine-ge90.html">http://www.bangaloreaviation.com/2009/10/worlds-largest-aircraft-engine-ge90.html</a> ....... I hope you will consider the bad experiences others are having with industrial wind turbines and vote no. Thank You, Daniel Berger... Petrolia

Petition · Paul Swift: Stop all wind turbine developments until "infrasound" health issues have been investigated · Change.org

Farmland Owner Encourages People Not to Sign up for Wind Turbines – Redheaded Blackbelt

A Problem With Wind Power [AWEO.org]

Medical testimony of Dr Herb Coussons — Friends Against Wind

The Power of Community - How Cuba Survived Peak Oil - YouTube

Trump on Wind Power's Problems (cancer too) — Friends Against Wind

<u>Infrasound & Low Frequency Noise: A Public Health Nightmare - YouTube</u>

Heroes of Burbo Bank Extension - YouTube

**Do Wind Turbines Lower Property Values?** 

Outage-prone West Marin mulls microgrids to create an 'island of power' - Marin

Independent Journal

Ontario Unwilling Hosts

Property value impacts: a rebuttal | Wind Energy Impacts and Issues

This country isn't just carbon neutral — it's carbon negative | Tshering Tobgay -

YouTube

Best Wind Turbine CRASH/FAIL Compilation HD 2016 - YouTube

Wind Energy And Birds | Windmills Kill

AWED – More Technical Information

Retired Cal Fire Battalion Chief warns of fire hazarrds posed by wind projects -

YouTube

Birdwatchers see rare swift killed by wind turbine - Telegraph

Cutting through the Spin | Wind Energy Impacts and Issues

Wind Turbine Shadow Flicker and Noise, Byron Wisconsin - YouTube

Life Under a Windplant - Part 3 - YouTube

Where does the problem stop? - Google Groups

Wind Turbine Projects | Windmills Kill

The Sound of Silence: Iowa Farmers Cherish Peace & Ouiet After Judge Shuts Down

Wind Turbines – STOP THESE THINGS

DON QUIXOTE BATTLES WINDMILLS - AND SO DO THE FOLKS IN

BOULEVARD | East County Magazine

Community Wind Farm Opposition | Wind Concerns Ontario

On infrasound generated by wind farms and its propagation in low-altitude tropospheric waveguides - Marcillo - 2015 - Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres - Wiley

**Online Library** 

Infrasound caused by Industrial Wind Turbines - YouTube

AWED - More Economic Information

SpeakOut Ontario - Nikki - YouTube

Peter Jelbart's submission to the senate inquiry — Friends Against Wind

Ontario Wind Resistance

AWED - Mission Statement

DOWN WIND - Wind Farm documentary - FULL DOC in HD - YouTube

About us | EPAW - European Platform Against Windfarms

Winning

Three Decades of Wind Industry Deception — Friends Against Wind

BlackburnNews.com - Unaddressed Wind Turbine Complaints Anger Local Group

Property Values Summary | Wind Farm Realities

"There is no escaping the torture from infrasound emissions from industrial wind

turbines." — Friends Against Wind

Community · Paul Swift: Stop all wind turbine developments until "infrasound" health

issues have been investigated · Change.org

WindAction | Wind Turbine Noise: Real Impacts on Neighbors

Ontario gothic | The Times

Voices of Vinalhaven, Maine: wind turbine noise Part 2 - YouTube

http://www.caithnesswindfarms.co.uk/AccidentStatistics.htm

Watch The Backstory | Why Noise Pollution Is More Dangerous Than We Think | The

New Yorker Video | CNE

DARK SIDE OF "GREEN": WIND TURBINE NOISE, FIRES, ACCIDENTS,

INJURIES, AND FFATALITIES RAISE SERIOUS SAFETY CONCERNS NEAR

RESIDENTIAL HOMES | Turbines on Fire

**Key Documents** 

Is Wind Energy Actually Clean? - YouTube

Carteret Wind Energy (AWED)

SA Farmers Paid \$1 Million to Host 19 Turbines Tell Senate they "Would Never Do it

Again" due to "Unbearable" Sleep-Destroving Noise – STOP THESE THINGS

Wind farm illness: Waubra Disease - YouTube

Life Under a Windplant - Part 2 - YouTube

Wind turbine noise from Australia - YouTube

**ILL Wind Reporting** 

Wind farm developer wants to meet with OC officials over opposition | Wind Energy

News

DOWN WIND - Wind Farm documentary - FULL DOC in HD - YouTube

Simplified Explanation of the Findings, Previous Research, and the Consequences —

Friends Against Wind

Wind Turbines - The Test of Time - YouTube

The Rapley Letter | Wind Farm Realities

There's a Persistent Hum in This Canadian City, and No One Knows Why | Wind

**Energy Impacts and Issues** 

Fanning the Flames... What do we really know about wind turbine fires? | Turbines on

<u>Fire</u>

Bird-Smart Wind Energy Solutions | American Bird Conservancy

<u>Understanding the Threat Wind Energy Poses to Birds | American Bird Conservancy</u>

The Voices of Tug Hill - YouTube

Life with Industrial Wind Turbines in Wisconsin Part 2 - YouTube

Tallest Wind Turbine in the U.S. installed at West Texas A&M University - YouTube

- MMWTWG Responses To MOECC Misleading Information

Lompoc residents blown away by recycled green energy Proposal | Wind Energy News

County finds protest petition on NextEra project valid | Wind Energy News

Concerned citizens give their reasons of why they are against a proposed wind turbine project | Wind Energy News

Citing wildlife impacts, North Dakota regulators deny siting permit for Burke County wind farm | Grand Forks Herald

National Wind Watch | Size of Industrial Wind Turbines

<u>Wind Farm Mass Attack: Wind Turbines Collapsing & Combusting Around the World – STOP THESE THINGS</u>

Blight for Naught: Wind Turbines and the Rationalized Desecration of Nature | False Progress

wind turbine out of control - YouTube

Living Next Door to a Wind Farm Australia - YouTube

WT's wind turbine is largest in U.S. - News - Amarillo Globe-News - Amarillo, TX

Offshore Wind Auction Unlocks the Potential for Green Energy in the US - Goodnet

Another Wind PTC Extension? No Thanks, Many in Industry Say | Greentech Media

Shell Brings Deep-Water Expertise to Boston to Capitalize on US Offshore Wind Boom | Greentech Media

Another Wind PTC Extension? No Thanks, Many in Industry Say | Greentech Media

World's Largest Wind Turbine Would Be Taller Than the Empire State Building -

Scientific American

Adverse Health Effects - Citizens' Task Force on Wind Power - Maine

<u>TerraGen's Wind Project – Tuluwat Examiner</u>

Rooftop solar throws massive curve ball to world's most isolated grid | RenewEconomy

The real energy revolution is happening in our homes | RenewEconomy

Solar in Spain | From The 'Sun Tax' To The Promotion Of Collective Self-Consumption

CIO FWP District-1-Chimenti-BOS-Letter Final.pdf - Google Drive

**Stop Fountain Wind** 

Stop Fountain Wind - Get Involved Now

Stop Fountain Wind - Get Informed

Stop Fountain Wind - Resources

WindAction

A Climate Conundrum: The Wind Farm Vs. The Eagle's Nest - The New York Times

<u>Terra-Gen Wind Farm Met by Vocal Opposition, Public Comment Extended by KMUD</u> News

Get real Vestas Nov 6th V2 2013 YouTube Vimeo HD 720p - YouTube

'Hook, Line and Turbine' | Views | North Coast Journal

Juniper Fire burning in Klickitat County | News | nbcrightnow.com

Wildfire in Southern Washington caused by wind turbine that caught fire -

oregonlive.com

Sen. Brewer: Cherry County case shows need for zoning rules on wind projects | Todays Column | nptelegraph.com

WindAction | Wildfire in Southern Washington caused by wind turbine that caught fire 'Dreadful' | Mailbox | North Coast Journal

WIND IS AN IRRELEVANCE TO THE ENERGY AND CLIMATE DEBATE | aimarciniak

Oregon Supreme Court invalidates Energy Council's rules for modifying power plants | Wind Energy News

National Wind Watch | Photos & Graphics

National Wind Watch | Photos & Graphics

Wind Energy and Wind Power News [Wind Watch]

Why Wind Turbines Threaten Endangered Species With Extinction

Falmouth Town Turbines Shut Down Forever; Two Neighbors React - Cape Cod Wave (17) No Wind Farm - Home

Why Wind Turbines Threaten Endangered Species With Extinction

Collapse of Wind Power Threatens Germany's Green Energy Transition | Watts Up With That?

'Planet of the Humans,' possibly most bracing environmental documentary ever made, premieres at Traverse City Film Festival | Wind Energy News

Shout It From the Rooftops: Solar Delivers Far More Than Renewable Energy | Greentech Media

Hammering Wind Industry Myths: the 'In-a-Nutshell' Version – STOP THESE THINGS

Wind farms: Are wind farms saving or killing us? A provocative investigation claims thousands of people are falling sick because they live near them | Daily Mail Online What! More wind turbines? Are you serious? | The Law is my Oyster

Board of Supervisors Moratorium Request District 3 - Rickert 6-11-19.pdf - Google Drive

Taylor Co. wind turbine fire sparks bigger blaze | KTAB - BigCountryHomepage.com 'They call it green' | Wind Energy News

Four numbers say wind and solar can't save climate | Wind Energy News

How to Enjoy the End of the World - YouTube

Wind Turbine Syndrome | "The biggest regret I've ever experienced" (Wisconsin)

Better Plan: The Trouble With Industrial Wind Farms in Wisconsin - Today's Special Feature

Better Plan: The Trouble With Industrial Wind Farms in Wisconsin - Today's Special Feature

Better Plan: The Trouble With Industrial Wind Farms in Wisconsin - Today's Special Feature

Wind Energy Has A Waste Problem: Disposing Of The Turbines: NPR

Solar Home News: Walmart to Tesla: The Roof is on Fire! PV Rent Programs, More

Wind costs more than you think due to massive federal subsidies

Blight for Naught: Wind Turbines and the Rationalized Desecration of Nature | False Progress

Oil is FINITE at any price. Why do people keep wasting it? | False Progress

Stop Fountain Wind - Articles of interest

WindAction | Naked in the wind

<u>Latest Blog Entries - Attorney Blog | Natural Resources, Commercial Law - Attorney Blog | Natural Resources, Commercial Law</u>

WindAction | Court: Injunction order halting construction of Crazy Mountain Wind farm

Proposed wind farm subject of lawsuits | The Livingston Enterprise

California blackouts: Keeping the lights on with solar energy

Ailments in Arkwright circle back to turbines | Wind Energy News

Wind power may forever change town of Arkwright | Wind Energy News

Wind firms seek control in 'neighbor' agreement | News, Sports, Jobs - Observer Today

Silent Menace (Part 1 of 2): Wind Turbine Infrasound – What You Can't Hear Can Hurt

You | Wind Energy Impacts and Issues

Silent Menace (Part 2 of 2): Wind Turbine Infrasound – What You Can't Hear Can Hurt

You | Wind Energy Impacts and Issues

Bound to Gag: Sierra Club Buries Evidence of Health Effects Caused by Wind Turbine Noise – STOP THESE THINGS

(PDF) INFRASOUND AND LOW FREQUENCY NOISE GUIDE-LINES:

ANTIQUATED AND IRRELEVANT FOR PROTECT- ING POPULATIONS Home

In Your Own Words — In The Shadow of Wind Farms

In the Shadow of Wind Farms

GE's World's Largest Wind Turbine Coming to Life This Year in the Netherlands,

Company Says | The Weather Channel

Wiyot Tribe on Wind Mills - Google Groups

Frank Keating: I signed wind industry tax breaks, and I was wrong | Columnists | tulsaworld.com

PG&E CORP Executive Salaries & Other Compensation | Salary.com

Carbon Footprint Factsheet | Center for Sustainable Systems

Wiyot Tribe, CA

(2) Eric Worrall's answer to Why are so many birds killed by wind turbines? - Quora Why do wind turbines fail?

MoveOn Petitions - Humboldt Wind Farm

(PDF) Involvement of cannabinoid receptors in infrasonic noise-induced neuronal impairment

Wind turbine opponents gearing up for court battle - News - Hillsdale.net - Hillsdale, MI - Hillsdale, MI

Germany's Nationalist Party Has Wind Industry in Limbo - Bloomberg

Wind turbines and low frequency noise: Implications for human health | Wind Energy Impacts and Issues

INFRASOUND AND LOW FREQUENCY NOISE - Ljubljana 2018 - YouTube

Professor Mariana Alves-Pereira explains vibroacoustic disease - YouTube

Fossil Fuel Subsidies Cost U.S. More than Defense Budget: IMF Report - Rolling Stone

'You won't understand it until you live it' | Letters to the Publisher |

wintersetmadisonian.com

Trespass zoning gives right to infringe on neighbor's property | Wind Energy News

Iowa 'loves' industrial wind? Not where I live - StarTribune.com

Good neighbors don't trespass | Wind Energy News

Do Wind Turbines Lower Property Values?

Adverse health effects of industrial wind turbines

Do Wind Turbines Lower Property Values?

Do Wind Turbines Lower Property Values?

aweo.org :: Industrial Wind Energy Opposition

» Wind Turbine Syndrome

Wind Turbines: Do the Health Risks Outweigh the Green Benefits? - Vitality Magazine Cliff Speaks out on Terra-Gen - YouTube

"GET OUT WHILE YOU CAN!" Big Wind Is Coming -- Arkwright NY (part 1) - YouTube

The thrilling potential for off-grid solar energy | Amar Inamdar - YouTube

Fw: Stop Terragen Unity Event - calcoastal2@gmail.com - Gmail

Terra-Gen wind power project hitting severe turbulence | Mad River Union

Wind turbines killing more than just local birds -- ScienceDaily

Power Generation | Energy Capital Partners

Planning Commission on 2019-11-14 4:00 PM - Special Meeting - Nov 14th, 2019

<u>Meet Jane Harper – Board member who regrets voting pro-wind – Illinois Leaks</u>

More than 100 residents sue Arkwright project developers | News, Sports, Jobs -

Observer Today

Invited Talk: Mariana Alves-Pereira on Livestream

County gets update on wind turbine tax appeals - Huron Daily Tribune

nasa-guide-to-evaluating-turbine-noise-hubbard-et-al-1982.pdf

**TimelineJS Embed** 

E92845.pdf

21 Peer Reviewed Articles On the Adverse Health Effects of Wind Turbine Noise –

**STOP THESE THINGS** 

Humboldt County Planning Commission Meeting - 2019-11-21: Access Humboldt:

Free Download, Borrow, and Streaming: Internet Archive

New Concentrating Solar Tower Is Worth Its Salt with 24/7 Power - Scientific

**American** 

Goals of the Solar Energy Technologies Office | Department of Energy

Cohocton Wind Watch: March 2009

Wind turbines kill up to 39 million birds a year! | CFACT

**Do Wind Turbines Lower Property Values?** 

Why we need personalized energy for the poor | Daniel Nocera | TEDxHarvardCollege -

**YouTube** 

Wind Turbine Syndrome | Medical doctor sees Wind Turbine Syndrome in his patients

(Vermont)

Wind Turbine Syndrome | Why wind energy is flawed

Kevon Martis Michigan Senate Energy Committee Testimony March 18 2014 -

**YouTube** 

A Wind Energy Enthusiast and a Wind Lease Holder Both Learn a Hard Lesson -

**YouTube** 

Kevon Martis speaks about Wind Turbines to NBC25's Brett Dickie - YouTube

Wildfire in Southern Washington caused by wind turbine that caught fire -

oregonlive.com

Life Under a Windplant - Part 1 - YouTube

Life Under a Windplant - Part 3 - YouTube

Living 1600 ft from a wind turbine - YouTube

Battery Powered Homes | Renewable Solar Energy Storage - YouTube

Why renewables can't save the planet | Michael Shellenberger | TEDxDanubia -

YouTube

The True Cost of Wind | Ryan M. Yonk - YouTube

Viktor Schauberger - Comprehend and Copy Nature (Documentary of 2008) - YouTube

Arkwright, New York | Wind Energy Videos

Arkwright wind project: a sick joke, our worst nightmare - YouTube

Abgebranntes Windrad in Isselburg. (in 4K) - YouTube

Burnt Wind Turbine Aftermath - YouTube

Wind Turbine Illness Chautaugua County NY - YouTube

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA GROUPS AGAINST WIND TURBINES Public

Group | Facebook

The Falmouth Conference on Human Rights | Wind Energy Videos

The Noise from Wind Turbines: Potential Adverse Impacts on Children's Well-Being

Mothers Against Wind Turbines Inc.

Quixotes Last Stand | Links to over 2200 International Anti-wind Groups

News - Supreme Court Upholds Osage Nation in Wind Farm Dispute | Heartland

**Institute** 

Rand.ogv

<u>Vermonters Say They Want Industrial Wind to Go the Way of the Billboard – Enjeux énergies et environnement</u>

**YouTube** 

<u>Industrial Wind Turbine Development and Loss of Social Justice? - Carmen M. E. Krogh</u>, 2011

Searchlight Wind Project Retreats, But Future of Wildlands Remains In Doubt

The Noise From Wind Turbines: Potential Adverse Impacts on Children's Well-Being - Arline L. Bronzaft, 2011

We Can Do This: Ending Fossil Fuels and Saving Wildlands

OP-ED: The Terra-Gen Wind Power Project Will Chain Us to the PG&E Grid and Ruin a Sacred Place | Lost Coast Outpost | Humboldt County

OP-ED: Wiyot Tribe Urges People to Cast a Wary Eye on Ridgetop Wind Power

Project, Submit Comments on its Environmental Impact Report | Lost Coast Outpost | Humboldt County

cutchabaldyblog

City of Rio Dell Opposes the Humboldt Wind Energy Project, Citing Environmental Concerns and Cultural Impact to Wivot Tribe | Lost Coast Outpost | Humboldt County

Protect Tsakiyuwit, Deny Terra-Gen's Wind Farm | Editor | North Coast Journal

Here's What Happens if You Replace Nuclear with Onshore Wind or Solar.

The impact of wind turbines on suicide — Friends Against Wind

Open letter to the World Health Organization (WHO) — Friends Against Wind

<u>Chevallier:</u> wind turbines, ecological sham and new public health tragedy — Friends <u>Against Wind</u>

Public Officials At Risk of Criminal Charges for Torture, by Ignoring Prolonged Sleep Deprivation from Environmental Noise — Friends Against Wind

Download: Environmental Impacts of Wind-Energy Projects | The National Academies Press

<u>Infrasound and Low Frequency Noise: Physics & Cells, History & Health — Friends Against Wind</u>

Infrasound caused by Industrial Wind Turbines — Friends Against Wind

Wind Turbine Battle — Friends Against Wind

GE LM6000 gas turbine spare parts | VBR Turbine Partners

**Electricity Consumption by County** 

A Movable Feast: This Mobile Power Plant Can Provide Electricity For Thousands — And Takes Just 2 Days To Install - GE Reports

Rural Living Canada: Wind Company and Farm Owner Sued Over Proposed Project

**Devaluation | Ontario Wind Resistance** 

PANDORA'S PROMISE - YouTube

Industry criticizes wind turbine report

The world's largest aircraft engine, the GE90-115B found on all Boeing 777-300ERs and 200LRs – Bangalore Aviation

From: <u>Planning Clerk</u>

To: Werner, Steve; Ford, John; Burkse@lacoassociates.com

Cc: Sharp, Ryan; Hayes, Kathy

Subject: FW: statement from Sylvie age 9 for today"s meeting

Date: Wednesday, November 27, 2019 9:11:43 AM

wednesday, November 27, 2017 7.11.43 AM

From: Carolyn Lehman <carolynleh@gmail.com> Sent: Thursday, November 21, 2019 1:26 PM

**To:** Planning Clerk <planningclerk@co.humboldt.ca.us> **Subject:** statement from Sylvie age 9 for today's meeting

### Dear Planning Commission,

You need to put in the windmills. It is very important to stop climate change sooner rather than later. If we do not stop this, THAN WHAT IS OUR <u>FUTURE</u> WORTH? We need to grow up have kids, and lead a life! If climate change continues, the earth will die. All of the birds, monkeys, sharks, fish, and <u>us.</u> We will die without reaching adulthood. That's why you need to put in the windmills.

-Sylvie Hunter, age 9, Fourth Grade

Please put me on the agenda. I want to speak this afternoon. Thank you. Sylvie From: <u>Planning Clerk</u>

To: Sharp, Ryan; Hayes, Kathy

Subject: FW: Support for Humboldt Wind Project Date: Tuesday, November 26, 2019 3:48:35 PM

From: Kit and Rebecca <rzkm@suddenlink.net> Sent: Thursday, November 21, 2019 9:31 AM

**To:** Planning Clerk <planningclerk@co.humboldt.ca.us>

**Subject:** Support for Humboldt Wind Project

I support the Planning Staff recommendations regarding the Humboldt Wind Project, ie that the Commission should certify the FEIR as adequate, and adopt the Statement of Overriding Considerations, in order to approve the project.

Kit Mann PO Box 567 Blue Lake, CA, 95525 707 668 5939 From: Werner, Steve

To: Lippre, Suzanne; Elizabeth Burks

Subject: FW: To Estelle Fennel from Lily Mscy

Date: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 11:05:47 AM

----Original Message-----

From: Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us> Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 7:34 AM

To: Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve <SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bass, Virginia

<VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex <RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Fennell, Estelle

<EFennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Wilson, Mike <Mike.Wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve

<smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Subject: FW: To Estelle Fennel from Lily Mscy

FYI

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board County of Humboldt (707) 476-2396 khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us

----Original Message-----

From: Sharon Abar <sharon.abar@gmail.com> Sent: Monday, December 9, 2019 6:48 PM To: Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us> Subject: To Estelle Fennel from Lily Mscy

Letter to 2nd District Supervisor Estelle Fennel from Lily Macy

Dear Estelle,

As your constituents and friends, my husband Jim and I want you to know how deeply opposed we are to the Terra-Gen Wind Energy Project. When Jim and I first saw Humboldt County in 1970 as tourists, we were struck by its sacred beauty and we made a decision to purchase land here. In 1971, we borrowed money to buy our 40 acres with the idea that one day we would retire here. That was almost 50 years ago! We did not buy our property to make a killing in the marijuana industry. We worked long and hard in the industrial sprawl of Southern California to be able to finally come here and live year-round. This we have been doing for the past 17 years.

We consider Humboldt County to be our spiritual home, so we can only imagine how the Wiyot Tribe must feel to have such desecration imposed upon their and our unique coastal prairie grasslands held sacred by them for generations. Not to mention the over 100 species of plants and animals that will be negatively affected by this desecration. Jim and I stand with the Wiyot Tribe. Our hearts are broken at the prospect of the Terra-Gen project happening on this site.

As you know, we have been vegan for 13 years and by doing that our carbon footprint is at least 50 percent smaller than those who eat a standard American diet. It is true that we live away from town, but we travel to town as little as possible. In all, we drive at least 60 percent less than we did when we were in the city. There are many ways to reduce the carbon footprint. Going vegan is one of the best.

Having finally escaped the urban sprawl of Southern California we just can't stand the fact that a greedy Southern

California corporation has followed us here to rip off one of the last vestiges of unique beauty and habitat left on this planet for what seems to be a good reason, but in truth is only motivated by profit. We are not opposed to wind farms as such, but the placement of them must be done with great care and consideration.

Please Estelle,	stand with	us and the V	Viyot Tribe	against this	corporate	takeover c	of our beautiful,	sacred Hum	boldt
County.									

Sincerely,

Lily Macy Ettersburg From: Werner, Steve

To: <u>Lippre, Suzanne</u>; <u>Elizabeth Burks</u>

Subject: FW: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 11:06:12 AM

Attachments: <u>image001.png</u>

From: Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 7:33 AM

**To:** Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve <SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bass, Virginia <VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex <RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Fennell, Estelle <EFennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Wilson, Mike <Mike.Wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve <smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Subject: FW: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

FYI

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board County of Humboldt (707) 476-2396 khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us



From: Carl Goff < Carl.Goff.260535351@p2a.co > Sent: Monday, December 9, 2019 6:36 PM
To: Hayes, Kathy < KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us >

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Carl Goff RE: Statement of Overriding Considerations ("OC"), Humboldt Wind Farm

**Humboldt County Board of Supervisors** 

Thank you again for accepting the opinions of the public on this significant project proposed for the County. The following are additional comments that were formulated since I got word that you are still accepting comments from the public. All the comments that follow are in relation to the proposed Statement of Overriding Considerations prepared by the Planning Department. I am very upset in the wording and import of the statements produced by our Humboldt County Planning Department. They are so biased that I feel compelled to respond.

1

The "EIR Statement of Overriding Considerations" represents an abuse of discretion. The County role in the permitting process is to evaluate objectively the impacts of the project, determine mitigations that will avoid significant adverse impacts and determine which impacts are unavoidable and significant. What was revealed to the public in the Planning Commission hearings is that the Humboldt County Planning Department did not perform those duties, but instead advocated for the interest of the project proponent. There was no member of the Planning Staff in their report to the Commission who opposed the project. On the contrary, the Department appeared as a proponent.

What makes this an abuse of discretion is the fact that

- (1) there were comments from the public in the public record that were overwhelmingly critical of the DEIR and Final EIR both submitted in print and at all public hearings,
- (2) that overwhelming critical negative public sentiment was expressed from residents immediately adjacent to the project, local Indigenous Tribes, wildlife experts, restoration experts, and Humboldt County citizens from throughout the County.
- And, (3), The Department did not present a "minority report" from staff who did not feel the Department should be an agent of the project proponent.

The public comments, both written and oral, provide numerous examples of public concerns not addressed. The Department merely swept them away dismissively, using language meant to deny their significance without providing scientific references upon which their dismissive opinions were based and upon which there could be a reasoned debate and resolution by the Supervisors. Lacking references and discussion, these dismissals can have no weight in the decision-making process before the Board.

Therefore, the Board of Supervisors does not have in hand an unbiased evaluation of the considerable negative impacts of the project, including those that are unavoidable and significant in regard to cultural and public trust resources. It would be an abuse of discretion to approve the project at this time. The Board needs to give strong direction to the Department

to provide objective analysis, including contrary opinions, before making any decision of approval or denial.

3

While the OC notes that SB 350 mandates reduction of GHGs, it does not inform the Board that penalties for not achieving goals in the legislation are not levied against local government, but against power selling retailers. In other words, SB 350 does not require the Board to approve this project and any Overriding Consideration based upon that misinterpretation of SB 350 would represent an abuse of discretion. This inadequate interpretation certainly undermines the validity of the OC that was prepared by the Department. The Department has no authority to scare the Board with penalties or legal liabilities in order to bias a decision before the Board.

The entire section "Statewide Environmental Benefits" falls into the above category. It is not the Board's responsibility to approve permits for energy retailers simply because it enables the retailers to avoid penalties.

Statewide considerations in the OC seem to be arguing in favor of sacrificing known cultural and public trust resources because of statewide concerns. The Board must first protect those resources for the benefit of the County and seek measures to "do its part" on statewide energy goals which do not sacrifice those resources. To do otherwise is an abrogation of the Board public trust responsibilities, again, a separate abuse of discretion.

While the local environmental benefits cited in the OC are touted, those benefits are not mandated by the General Plan and other provisions. Those provisions are guidelines, but nowhere do these guidelines mandate a Statement of Overriding Considerations be issued for every project that would create a renewable source of energy. In other words, the Board's hand is not forced by the arguments put before it by the Department and project proponent.

In dismissing the viability of alternative sources of energy other than the proposed project, the OC cites individuals who claim that "rooftop solar cannot realistically supplant wind energy." There are no facts and figures cited, nor any studies. The only citations are from individual opinions. The Planning Commission, however, heard from local solar contractors, the people with real knowledge of the profitability of their enterprises, who refuted those opinions.

4

In regard to "Economic Benefits," the Department did not present to the Board an analysis which included a comparison of economic benefits from other energy production sources, including off-shore wind and solar. Failure to provide this kind of analysis should result in the Board sending the project permitting process back to the Department so that the Department can provide the Board an analysis upon which the Board (and public) can evaluate the present project in the context of economic benefits of power generation from all potential sources. This process must be completed before deciding that the claimed economic benefits require the Board to find Overriding Considerations to approve this project.

In regard to "Resource Benefits," the Department both claims the Russ land is kept contiguous and is held in divided patent parcels, and that the Russ Ranch is threatening to sub-divide the land into residential units. The land is enrolled in the Williamson Act, recognizing the monetary value to the County and to the Russ Ranch since it is restricted to agricultural use. If the Russ Ranch decides to sell residential parcels, the County will derive economic benefits in the form of property and sales tax revenue along with the Russ Ranch who will derive income from the sale. The Department does not provide the Board with facts and figures of this economic benefit and should be required to flesh out their position against such an activity.

The Resource Benefits of the current land ownership are not specific and only general in nature. The Department needs to determine what species would be harmed and which might gain if cattle are removed from the area. For example, there are residential communities in Humboldt County whose establishment have been beneficial for the natural resources, especially in areas that were slated for short-term rotation forestry or on depleted rangeland. There are maturing stands of forest which enable native plants and animals to recover population and landscape relations. The benefits to aquatic species have been documented as well in the headwaters of the Mattole.

Claiming that the land must either be held as an agricultural, open space unit or subdivided into wildlife destroying homes is a false choice. There are a number of different ways land can accommodate residential use which is of benefit to natural resources. In addition, the Board needs to recognize the creativity of County residents over the past 40 years.

6

There are many residential areas in the County, developed since 1960, which are self-sufficient in energy production with vibrant natural resource protection. In fact, the development of alternative energy world-wide owes a debt to the creative and enterprising activities of Humboldt residents since the 60s. In the 1980s, Humboldt County purchased 30% of all solar panels sold in the US. This creative spirit lives on and will continue to push for environmental solutions to current climate considerations. Approving the present project will inhibit that creative development which has been the backbone of the Humboldt economy for several decades. The value of small scale economic activity aggregated in Humboldt has been poorly understood, but it has kept Humboldt on its feet since the decline of the timber resource economy.

Large scale economic solutions and activities are easier to measure, but they have not proven to be sustainable. Humboldt needs a mix of both small and large economic initiatives. This project should not be included because of the paucity of jobs involved weighed against the magnitude of unavoidable impacts.

In addition, there is no analysis of the impact to Humboldt's tourist economy from the disruption and loss of wildlife species from this project. Following timber's decline, tourism has

grown in our biologically diverse hot spot. This project's impacts are heavy on this economic resource.

7

The wind turbines are known bird and bat killers. There is no statement claiming that this project will not kill creatures. These are acknowledged facts. We reject categorically the use of public trust and cultural resources in a Science Project, which is proposed by the formation of a Technical Advisory Committee. The Board should reject this notion as well. We do not torture animals for study, a practice that is illegal in the State of California. To approve such an experiment knowing that it involves the death of listed species is illegal and an abuse of discretion.

Thank you for your consideration of these issues. These comments are on behalf of myself and the Lost Coast League. I look forward to your response and trust that it will reasoned, backed by facts and referenced rigorous science.

Michael Evenson PO Box 157

Petrolia, CA 95558

Michael Evenson

evenson@igc.org

From: john hobbs
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 7:21:17 AM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, john hobbs

From: Clifford Cole
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 7:14:06 AM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Clifford Cole 
 From:
 Larry S. Solar

 To:
 Hayes, Kathy

 Subject:
 Terra-Gen

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 5:06:37 PM

According to the Humboldt county General Plain "Humboldt County Produces most of It's own electricity"

The peak demand for electricity in the county is 170 mega watts. The PG&E gas generating station alone

produces 163 mega watts. With biomass Humboldt County can easily meet it's peak demand. If a big switch could be installed to disconnect us from the greater grid Humboldt could produce all

the energy it consumes; being cut off from the greater grid would eliminate many of our costly blackouts.

All energy statistics were obtained from the general plan.

According to the General Plan "lighting and refrigeration" are major contributors to peak demand.

More LED lighting, doors on supermarket coolers and more efficient domestic refrigerators would

reduce both the county's peak demand and energy consumption. Murphy's market in Sunny Brea recently installed doors on their in front of their previously open coolers the new doors save energy and as a consequence of new LED lighting make a more effective display. Health Sport in Arcata is in the process of replacing their faulty fluorescent lightts with LED lighting. Retrofits such as these will reduce peak demand and annual energy consumption.

Conservation is the most effective way to reduce our carbon footprint. Putting a windmill in a difficult and expensive location is not the most effective way to reduce our carbon footprint.

Larry Schlussler Phd Sun Frost Arcata CA

i

From: <u>Jason Chipley</u>
To: <u>Hayes, Kathy</u>

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 7:00:10 AM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Jason Chipley From: Chris Snyder
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 5:35:19 AM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Chris Snyder From: <u>Louis Luna</u>
To: <u>Hayes, Kathy</u>

**Subject:** Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 5:09:04 AM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Louis Luna From: Tom Caraisco
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 5:07:17 AM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Tom Caraisco From: John griswold

To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 4:58:54 AM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, John griswold From: Santos Mendoza
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit Date: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 12:37:12 AM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Santos Mendoza From: SIROT Jean-Pierre
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit Date: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 12:24:50 AM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, SIROT Jean-Pierre From: <u>tristan kennedy</u>
To: <u>Hayes, Kathy</u>

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 11:47:19 PM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, tristan kennedy From: HARVEY BROWN
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 10:01:14 PM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, HARVEY BROWN From: derek deroco
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 9:08:10 PM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, derek deroco From: Robert Wise

To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 8:44:21 PM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Robert Wise From: Enrique Aguilar
To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 8:39:28 PM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Enrique Aguilar From: Felix Huerta

To: Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 7:51:41 PM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Felix Huerta From: <u>Jeff Hunerlach</u>
To: <u>Hayes, Kathy</u>

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 7:43:18 PM

# Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards, Jeff Hunerlach 
 From:
 Lauren H

 To:
 Hayes, Kathy

Subject: Terra Gen Wind Project

**Date:** Monday, December 9, 2019 7:15:19 PM

# December 9, 2019

Dear Humboldt County Board of Supervisors,

I am writing in opposition to the Terra Gen Wind project. I feel that the drawbacks from this project significantly outweigh the benefits. Even with carefully argued mitigation.

To approve this project, Terra Gen needs to have a completed EIR. This should be enough reason to deny them. It would be a huge mistake to let them go forward without the mandatory completed EIR. We need to know how this project will affect Humboldt and the community before approval. They need to follow the laws/rules like everyone else and complete the EIR before approval.

This project would be a great asset in the right location, but Monument Ridge and Bear Ridge are not the right locations for this project. They are both located on Wiyot Tribal cultural sites. The Wiyot has expressed that they do not support the project and I stand with them. These locations are right off highway 101 and will be visible to all traffic entering and exiting Humboldt County. They will be a significant eyesore and the first and last thing people will see and remember.

The location is also a major route for migrating birds and is not far (as the crow flies) from Humboldt Bay Wildlife Refuge. Birds and bats would be threatened. According to research right now an estimated 140,000-328,000 birds are killed per year by flying or being sucked into wind turbines. Humboldt is a sanctuary for migrating birds. We WILL see the impact that the wind turbines make in a short amount of time. Without the completion of the EIR we will not know the true impact the project will have on the birds and wildlife and at that point it will be too late. The Terra Gen Wind Project will also be an automatic death sentence to the Condors planned to be released next year.

Humboldt is in dire need to become less dependent on fossil fuels and this project will not do that. We need to create out own power not power for the rest of California. There has not been adequate information given to the public stating that the power generated by this project will stay in Humboldt. We need to come up with our own plans that benefit us directly and keep huge corporations out of Humboldt county. They do not care about our environment.

Wind Turbine blades have a lifespan of 10-20 years and cannot be recycled. Damaged wind turbines with fill landfills. They also have a high rate of failure-and can explode - shooting fire balls of oil into wildlands. Each turbine holds about 400 gallons of oil.

Lastly Terra Gen has not plan for removal of this project once completed. These turbines do not fit on trucks and must be barged out. Terra Gen has no plan to remove the turbines in 20 years after they are no good and will probably be left as litter. They need to remove all their garbage.

Please consider my remarks regarding this huge and harmful wind project. We can't undo this kind of damage. We need to plan for climate change, but this is not the answer to become less dependent on fossil fuels.

Sincerely,
Lauren Kurth
FJBLauren@gmail.com
(530)927-9805
3215 Halfway Ave. Unit A
Mckinleyville, CA 95519

From: Werner, Steve
To: Lippre, Suzanne

Subject: FW: Humboldt Wind Project

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 3:31:08 PM

Attachments: <u>image001.png</u>

From: Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 2:01 PM

**To:** Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve <SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bass, Virginia <VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex <RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Fennell, Estelle <EFennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Wilson, Mike <Mike.Wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve <smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>

**Subject:** FW: Humboldt Wind Project

FYI

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board County of Humboldt (707) 476-2396 khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us



**From:** Denise Sweaney < denises 1948@gmail.com >

Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 1:59 PM

**To:** Bass, Virginia < VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex < RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; efennel@co.humboldt.ca.us; Wilson, Mari < MWilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve < smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>; michellebushnell@sohumusd.com; cliff@khum.com; Hayes, Kathy

<<u>KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>

Subject: Re: Humboldt Wind Project

With Solar generated electricity, I have increased property value, little fire hazard, no animals killed, no water source destroyed, and no desecration of tribal lands. With wind turbine generated electricity, I have devalued property value, extreme fire hazard, animal deaths, water degradation, and desecration of tribal lands. Which would you choose to support?

Jobs will be local TEMPORARY Union jobs - emphasis on TEMPORARY - which are not worth the permanent destruction of our area. This is your legacy. And no, Ms. Fennel, this 'whole does not justify the means', of this destruction of Humboldt.

The Humboldt Planning Commission voted no on the Terra Gen Project. Please be a representative government and vote no on the Terra Gen Catastrophic Plan.

Thank you for your time, Denise Sweaney, Rio Dell Resident From: Werner, Steve
To: Lippre, Suzanne
Subject: FW: No to Terra Gen!

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 3:31:18 PM

Attachments: <u>image001.png</u>

From: Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 1:53 PM

**To:** Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve <SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bass, Virginia <VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex <RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Fennell, Estelle <EFennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Wilson, Mike <Mike.Wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve <smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>

**Subject:** FW: No to Terra Gen!

FYI

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board County of Humboldt (707) 476-2396 khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us



**From:** Jovanah Martinez-Hoboo < <u>imartinez-hoboo@cuttensd.org</u>>

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 1:51 PM **To:** Hayes, Kathy < <u>KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>

**Subject:** No to Terra Gen!

Dear Humboldt County Board of Supervisors,

I am writing today with interest in sharing my views on the proposed Terra Gen wind turbine project. I vehemently oppose the Terra Gen project for several reasons. The cutting into the earth on sacred Wiyot sites is completely unacceptable and unethical.. Our community has already gained so much off the desecration of the Wiyot people's land and ancestors. It would be in very poor taste to continue such blatant imperialism at the hands of the Wiyot. Secondly, the wind turbines would decimate the local migrating bird population. Other wind turbine projects have harmed bird populations as well and it is worth the research to understand why wind turbines are not the solution.

Third, the community that lives downwind of the turbines would be greatly distrubed by the noise that this project would create and the noise it would continue to produce as the turbines are in operation, not to mention the light pollution from the proposed spot lights on the turbines. Lastly, this is not the solution to our energy problems, because it will only add to our community strife as

well as destroying precious and sacred land.

Vote no on the Terra Gen project, listen to your community and not corporations or those who would profit off of this project.

Thank you for your time,

Jovanah P. Martinez-Hoboo

From: Werner, Steve
To: Lippre, Suzanne

Subject: FW: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

**Date:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 3:31:31 PM

Attachments: <u>image001.png</u>

From: Hayes, Kathy <KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Sent: Tuesday, December 10, 2019 1:52 PM

**To:** Ford, John <JFord@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Werner, Steve <SWerner@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bass, Virginia <VBass@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Bohn, Rex <RBohn@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Fennell, Estelle <EFennell@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Wilson, Mike <Mike.Wilson@co.humboldt.ca.us>; Madrone, Steve <smadrone@co.humboldt.ca.us>

Subject: FW: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

FYI

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board County of Humboldt (707) 476-2396 khayes@co.humboldt.ca.us



From: James Pearson < <u>James.Pearson.260740281@p2a.co</u>>

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 10, 2019 1:49 PM **To:** Hayes, Kathy < <u>KHayes@co.humboldt.ca.us</u>>

Subject: Support Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit

Dear Member of the Board,

I'm a member of the Operating Engineers Local 3 and I'm writing to urge you to support the Humboldt Wind LLC Conditional Use Permit. It is important to build this project not only to create economic growth and high paying jobs in the area, but to do our part to contribute to the next generation green energy that our state needs.

Terra-Gen, the proposed developers of this project have signed a Project Labor Agreement with the Building Trades Council of Humboldt and Del Norte Counties and have agreed to build this project with 100% union labor. That means that the workforce will be dispatched from local union halls to this project and those workers will be paid wages true to their high skill and training. These wages will then stay local and be spent in the community. A union workforce will help guarantee that this project will be built on time, on budget, and most importantly for our community: safely.

In addition to the economic benefits of building this project with a union workforce, there is also the benefits both locally and globally of bringing more green power on line. In order to meet the recent goal of California for producing 100% zero-carbon electricity by 2045 we need to begin building those green power projects now. This 155-megawatt project would be able to power 85% of households in Humboldt County with safe, clean energy. Everyone has to do their part in this effort, and this project helps us all meet that goal.

Please add this letter to the record for the Board's proceedings on December 16th, and count me as a strong supporter of union labor and green power. Please vote to authorize Humboldt Wind LLC's Conditional Use Permit.

Regards,
James Pearson