



COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT

AGENDA ITEM NO.

H I

For the meeting of: January 23, 2018

Date: November 22, 2017
To: Board of Supervisors
From: Supervisor Virginia Bass
Subject: Discussion Related to the Prohibition of Raw Milk Sales in Humboldt County

RECOMMENDATION(S): That the Board of Supervisors take input from members of the public and County staff as it relates to the benefits and/or public safety concerns of allowing the sale of raw milk in Humboldt County, and take appropriate action, if required.

SOURCE OF FUNDING: N/A

DISCUSSION: On August 24, 2010, the Board of Supervisors received a presentation from raw milk advocates outlining the benefits of raw milk consumption, as well as input from county staff describing the public safety concerns of raw milk consumption.

As Humboldt County currently has an ordinance in place which prohibits the sale of raw milk, raw milk advocates are once again requesting that the Board of Supervisors consider the repeal of the current ordinance to allow for the sale of raw milk in Humboldt County.

FINANCIAL IMPACT: N/A

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT: N/A

ALTERNATIVES TO STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS: Board discretion.

ATTACHMENTS: Board Order No H-2 from the August 24, 2010 Board Meeting

Prepared by Kathy Hayes

Signature Virginia Bass

REVIEW:

Auditor _____ County Counsel _____ Personnel _____ Risk Manager _____ Other _____

TYPE OF ITEM:

____ Consent
____ Departmental
____ Public Hearing
XX Other Board Initiated (10 min)

PREVIOUS ACTION/REFERRAL:

Board Order No. H-2

Meeting of: August 24, 2010

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT
Upon motion of Supervisor _____ Seconded by Supervisor _____

Ayes
Nays
Abstain
Absent

SEE ACTION SUMMARY

and carried by those members present, the Board hereby approves the recommended action contained in this Board report.

Dated: _____

By: _____
Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board

**Humboldt County Board of Supervisors
Agenda Item Transmittal**

From: Supervisor Bonnie Neely
Meeting Date: August 24, 2010
Time Required: 20 minutes

Time - 9: 30 a.m.

Contact for Information

Name: Kat Hayes

Telephone: 476-2396

14-2

Subject: Presentation on the Benefits of Raw Milk Consumption.

Summary: Raw Milk Advocates in Humboldt County will give a presentation to the Board of Supervisors putting forth information related to the benefits of Raw Milk consumption. As Humboldt County currently has an Ordinance in place which prohibits the sale of Raw Milk, advocates promoting the sale of Raw Milk have requested an opportunity to provide information to the Board on the benefits of Raw Milk.

Requested Action: Hear the presentation and take appropriate action, if required.


Signature

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT

Upon motion of Supervisor

Seconded by Supervisor

Ayes
Nays
Abstain
Absent

and carried by those members present, the Board hereby approves the recommended action contained in this Board report.

Dated: _____

By: _____

Kathy Hayes, Clerk of the Board

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, COUNTY OF HUMBOLDT, STATE OF CALIFORNIA
Certified Copy of Portion of Proceedings, Meeting of Tuesday, August 24, 2010

SUBJECT: Presentation on the Benefits of Raw Milk Consumption.

ACTION: A motion was made and seconded to direct staff to review educational information provided at today's meeting and bring back to a future date, undetermined for further discussion.

Adopted on motion by Supervisor Neely and seconded by Supervisor Lovelace and the following vote:

AYES: Supervisors: Lovelace, Clendenen, Neely

NAYS: Supervisors: Smith, Duffy

ABSENT: Supervisors:

ABSTAIN: Supervisors:


STATE OF CALIFORNIA)
County of Humboldt) ss.

I, Nikki Turner, Deputy Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, County of Humboldt, State of California, do hereby certify the foregoing to be a full, true, and correct copy of the original made in the above-entitled matter by said Board of Supervisors at a meeting held in Eureka, California as the same now appears of record in my Office.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed the Seal of said Board of Supervisors.

NIKKI TURNER

Deputy Clerk of the Board of Supervisors of the
County of Humboldt, State of California


Dated: August 24, 2010

(H-2)

Hayes, Kathy

From: Counts, Kim
Sent: Tuesday, January 09, 2018 1:15 PM
To: Hayes, Kathy
Subject: Documentation
Attachments: 0213_001.pdf

Hi Kathy,

Please find attached information County Health Officer Donald Baird would like to have forwarded to the Board members regarding the raw milk agenda item, which will be heard on January 23.

Please let me know if you have any questions. Thank you.

Kim Counts

Executive Secretary, Public Health
529 I Street, Eureka, CA 95501
(707) 268-2120



From: ah07m@humboldt.ca.us [mailto:ah07m@humboldt.ca.us]
Sent: Tuesday, January 9, 2018 11:09 AM
To: Counts, Kim <kcounts@co.humboldt.ca.us>
Subject: Attached Image

1. The attached document is from CDPH and summarizes the 2016 *E. coli* O157 outbreak associated with the consumption of unpasteurized milk associated with Organic Pastures Dairy Company. Patients associated with this outbreak were residents of Humboldt, Alameda, Fresno, Kern, San Luis Obispo, San Mateo, Santa Barbara, Santa Clara, and Sonoma counties.
2. From CDPH below :
<https://archive.cdph.ca.gov/HealthInfo/discond/Pages/RawMilk.aspx>

California outbreaks due to raw milk or raw dairy products included:

- a. Cases of *Salmonella* Dublin infections in the 1970s into early 1980s that were associated with raw milk consumption. One published investigation in 1979 documented 113 patients with 89 hospitalizations and 22 deaths. Several patients had a serious underlying disease such as leukemia or lymphoma that might have predisposed them to a more severe outcome.
- b. Two outbreaks of *Campylobacter* infection, one in 1984 where several children and adults were ill after drinking raw milk while on a tour of a dairy, and another in 1985 where several people became infected after drinking raw milk on a tour of a bottling plant.
- c. Two outbreaks of multidrug-resistant *Salmonella* infection associated with eating unpasteurized Mexican-style cheese in 1997 resulting in over 10 culture-confirmed cases.
- d. An outbreak of *E. coli* O157 infection in September 2006 that affected six children, three of whom were hospitalized including two with kidney failure.
- e. A cluster of diarrheal illness and *Campylobacter* infections in May-June 2008 that affected some members of a cow-share program who consumed raw milk; one of those affected developed a form of Guillain-Barré syndrome that required prolonged hospitalization.

3. Article from [foodsafetynews.com](http://www.foodsafetynews.com) -I don't know how reputable these folks are -- they come as ambulance chasers to me. This list is from their article located here:
<http://www.foodsafetynews.com/2016/02/six-kids-sickened-in-outbreak-linked-to-organic-pastures-raw-milk/>

The past decade at Organic Pastures

Previous recalls and foodborne illness outbreaks linked to Organic Pastures in the past decade include:

October 2015 – Organic Pastures raw milk recall and quarantine after CDFA inspectors found Campylobacter as a result of product testing conducted as part of routine inspection and sample collection at the facility.

September 2012 – Organic Pastures raw milk recall and quarantine after CDFA inspectors found Campylobacter bacteria as a result of product testing conducted as part of routine inspection and sample collection at the facility.

January-April 2012 – Organic Pastures products linked to campylobacter outbreak. Raw milk, raw skim milk, raw cream and raw butter were recalled and the dairy quarantined after the confirmed detection of campylobacter bacteria in raw cream.

State officials identified at least 10 people with campylobacter infections throughout California. They reported consuming Organic Pastures raw milk prior to illness onset. Their median age was 11.5 years, with six younger than 18. The age range was nine months to 38 years.

August-October 2011 — Organic Pastures products linked to E. coli outbreak.

A cluster of five young children with E. coli O157:H7 infections with matching pulse-field gel electrophoresis (PFGE) patterns was identified. Illness onsets were from Aug. 25 to Oct. 25. All five children reported drinking commercially available raw milk from a single dairy, Organic Pastures, and had no other common exposures.

Investigations by the CDPH's Food and Drug Branch and the California Department of Food and Agriculture showed environmental samples collected at Organic Pastures yielded E. coli O157:H7 isolates that had PFGE patterns indistinguishable from the patient isolates.

September 2008 — Organic Pastures Grade A raw cream recall and quarantine after state testing and confirmation testing detected campylobacter bacteria in the cream.

September 2007 — Organic Pastures Grade A raw cream recall and quarantine following laboratory confirmation of the presence of Listeria monocytogenes bacteria. CDFA inspectors found the bacteria as a result of product testing conducted as part of routine inspection and sample collection at the facility.

November-December 2007 — Organic Pastures cows linked to Campylobacter outbreak. State officials found 50 strains of Campylobacter jejuni plus Campylobacter coli, Campylobacter fetus, Campylobacter hyointestinalis and Campylobacter lari when they cultured feces from Organic Pastures dairy cow feces.

There was only one patient isolate available for DNA fingerprinting, but it was identical to isolates from four cattle fecal samples collected at Organic Pastures.

September 2006 — Organic Pastures linked to E. coli O157:H7 outbreak.

Six sick children were identified by state officials. Four had culture-confirmed infections, one had a culture-confirmed infection and HUS (hemolytic uremic syndrome, which can result in kidney failure and stroke), and one had HUS only. The median age of patients was 8 years, with a range of 6 to 18 years.

Organic Pastures' operators claimed the illnesses were linked to consumption of fresh spinach that was linked to a separate E. coli outbreak in 2006.

However, the five children who consumed Organic Pastures' products who had culture confirmation were laboratory matches to each other and the CDC reported their specific E. coli isolates "differed markedly from the patterns of the concurrent E. coli O157:H7 outbreak strain associated with spinach consumption."

All information above from Hava and Eric

4. Six ill, 2 dead in Listeria outbreak tied to Vulto soft cheese

Jim Wappes | Editorial Director | CIDRAP News Mar 09, 2017

<http://www.cidrap.umn.edu/news-perspective/2017/03/six-ill-2-dead-listeria-outbreak-tied-vulto-soft-cheese>

5. People in Four States May Be Drinking Contaminated Raw Milk

CDC and partners urge families at risk to see their doctor for antibiotics

For Immediate Release: Tuesday, November 21, 2017

<https://www.cdc.gov/media/releases/2017/p1121-contaminated-raw-milk.html>

In late September, a New Jersey woman became ill after drinking raw milk from the company. CDC confirmed her illness was Brucella RB51 in late October. Because Udder Milk has not provided information about the farms that supply their milk, it has not been possible to trace the source of the woman's infection. CDC scientists have been collaborating with state health officials on the investigation. The U.S. Department of Agriculture and the U.S. Food and Drug Administration are working with state health and agriculture officials to trace the source of the contaminated raw milk and raw milk products.

6. CDC and Texas Health Officials Warn About Illness Linked to Raw Milk from Texas Dairy

Raw milk contained rare but dangerous germ, consumers should get antibiotics

For Immediate Release: Friday, September 15, 2017

CDC advises that people who consumed raw milk or milk products from the K-Bar Dairy between June 1 and Aug. 7, 2017, should get antibiotic treatment to avoid the risk of lifelong, chronic infections. Initially, people with brucellosis experience fever, sweats, aches and fatigue. If not treated, *Brucella* RB51 infection can result in long-term complications, like arthritis; heart problems; enlargement of the spleen or liver; and, in rare cases, nervous system problems, like meningitis. RB51 can cause severe illness in people with weakened immune systems and miscarriages in pregnant women.

7. Volume 23, Number 6—June 2017 Research

Outbreak-Related Disease Burden Associated with Consumption of Unpasteurized Cow's Milk and Cheese, United States, 2009–2014

https://wwwnc.cdc.gov/eid/article/23/6/15-1603_article
Abstract

The growing popularity of unpasteurized milk in the United States raises public health concerns. We estimated outbreak-related illnesses and hospitalizations caused by the consumption of cow's milk and cheese contaminated with Shiga toxin–producing *Escherichia coli*, *Salmonella* spp., *Listeria monocytogenes*, and *Campylobacter* spp. using a model relying on publicly available outbreak data. In the United States, outbreaks associated with dairy consumption cause, on average, 760 illnesses/year and 22 hospitalizations/year, mostly from *Salmonella* spp. and *Campylobacter* spp. Unpasteurized milk, consumed by only 3.2% of the population, and cheese, consumed by only 1.6% of the population, caused 96% of illnesses caused by contaminated dairy products. Unpasteurized dairy products thus cause 840 (95% CrI 611–1,158) times more illnesses and 45 (95% CrI 34–59) times more hospitalizations than pasteurized products. As consumption of unpasteurized dairy products grows, illnesses will increase steadily; a doubling in the consumption of unpasteurized milk or cheese could increase outbreak-related illnesses by 96%.

8. Diseases from Raw Milk Consumption Neal Chamberlain, PhD, A.T. Still University of Health Sciences/ Kirksville College of Osteopathic Medicine

<https://www.atsu.edu/faculty/chamberlain/rawmilk.htm>

Milk is an important part of a person's diet. Unfortunately, it can also carry certain organisms that can cause severe disease in humans (1). One way to prevent this is by pasteurizing the milk. Pasteurization kills the organisms that cause disease without destroying the milk. It also increases the shelf life of milk by destroying proteins and bacteria in the milk that cause it to spoil. Click on the links below to read a few reports of human illness caused by the consumption of raw milk or raw milk products:

1. Real life videos of infections from drinking raw milk.

2. 2017 Multi-state outbreak of *Listeria* infections from raw milk soft cheese consumption.
3. *Salmonella* Typhimurium Infection Associated with Raw Milk and Cheese Consumption --- Pennsylvania, 2007
4. Outbreak of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in children in California (2006)

Below are some diseases associated with drinking raw milk.

10 Diseases	Organism	Symptoms and Complications
Campylobacteriosis	<i>Campylobacter</i> sp.	bloody diarrhea
Salmonellosis	<i>Salmonella</i> sp.	bloody diarrhea
Hemolytic Uremic Syndrome	<i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	diarrhea, kidney failure, death
Yersiniosis	<i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i>	diarrhea
Listeriosis	<i>Listeria monocytogenes</i>	meningitis, blood infections
Tuberculosis	<i>Mycobacterium tuberculosis</i>	tuberculosis; pneumonia
Brucellosis	<i>Brucella</i> sp.	blood infections, heart infections
Cryptosporidiosis	<i>Cryptosporidium parvum</i>	diarrhea
Staphylococcal enterotoxin poisoning	<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	vomiting
Q fever	<i>Coxiella burnetii</i>	high fever, severe headache, muscle aches (can infect the liver and/or heart)

For more information on how milk is pasteurized click on the University of Guelph's [Dairy Science and Technology page](#).

1. Potter ME, Kaufmann AF, Blake PA, Feldman RA. Unpasteurized milk: the hazards of a health fetish. JAMA 1984;252:2048--52.

2. Hazards of raw milk product consumption.

9. Consumption of Raw or Unpasteurized Milk and Milk Products by Pregnant Women and Children <http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/pediatrics/133/1/175.full.pdf>